



**Marin HIV/AIDS Care Council Meeting  
MINUTES**

**Wednesday, June 12, 2013**

**4:30p.m. - 6:30p.m.**

**3240 Kerner Blvd.**

**San Rafael, CA 94901**

**Connection Center – Room 110**

**[ Approved July 11, 2013 ]**

Larry Meredith, Ph.D.  
DIRECTOR

Margaret Kisliuk  
DIVISION DIRECTOR

HIV/AIDS Services

Community Health &  
Prevention Services  
899 Northgate Drive  
Suite 415  
San Rafael, CA 94903  
415 473 7590 T  
415 473 6266 F  
475 473 3232 TTY  
www.marincounty.org/hs

**Council Members Present:** Roy Bateman, Kevin Cronin, Trinity Dushon, Elaine J. Flores, James Frazier, Deborah Kasel, Walter Kelley, Jennifer Malone, Scott Marcum

**Council Members Absent:** None

**Staff Present:** Cicily Emerson, Chris Santini, Michael Schieble, Sparkie Spaeth

**Public:** None.

**I. Call to Order.**

Co-Chair Marcum called the meeting to order at 4:44p.m.

**II. Roll Call.**

Roll was called at 4:44p.m. Quorum was established, with 7 of 9 Members present.

CM Dushon and CM Kelley arrived after the roll call and the final attendance increased to all 9 Members present.

**III. Review and Approval of Agenda - VOTE**

CM Bateman motioned to approve the agenda. CM Frazier seconded.

A voice **vote** was conducted. No objections were heard.

The agenda was approved.

**IV. Review and Approval of March 27, 2013, April 10, 2013, and May 8, 2013 Minutes – VOTE**

March 27, 2013 Minutes

CM Malone made motion to approve the March 27, 2013 minutes. CM Bateman seconded.

The draft minutes were reviewed. A voice **vote** was conducted. No objections were heard.

The minutes from the March 27, 2013 Marin Care Council meeting were approved.

4:49p.m. CM Kelley arrives.

April 10, 2013 Minutes

CM Frazier made motion to approve the April 10, 2013 minutes. CM Bateman seconded.

The draft minutes were reviewed. A voice **vote** was conducted. No objections were heard.

The minutes from the April 10, 2013 Marin Care Council meeting were approved.

May 8, 2013 Minutes

CM Malone made motion to approve the May 8, 2013 minutes. CM Kasel seconded.

The draft minutes were reviewed. CM Bateman requested a clarification on item "XI. Core Services - Oral Health".

A voice **vote** was conducted. No objections were heard.

The minutes from the May 8, 2013 Marin Care Council meeting were approved.

**V. General Announcements**

CM Kelley announced 1.) "HIV, Benefits, & Healthcare Reform: Consumer Info Training" June 17 & 24, 2013, San Francisco LGBT Center. 2.) Community Action Marin /CAM "Low Income Home Energy Assistance Program" (flyer). 3.) Reported on the benefits counseling program and employment services provided by Positive Resource Center. 4.) Reported on Healthcare Workers and Service Employees International Union /SEIU June 4, 2013 lobbying efforts.

CM Malone announced 1.) The AIDS Walk San Francisco is Sunday, July 21, 2013. All were encouraged to participate and walk. 2.) On Sunday, June 23, 2013 from 12:00p.m. to 3:30p.m. a picnic will be held at Piper Park in Larkspur to "kick off" and welcome the AIDS Walk M.A.P. Team. 3.) Due to anticipated Ryan White Part A funding cuts, M.A.P. will be lowering the benefit limit for Emergency Funds and restricting assistance to individuals from the lowest income tier.

**VI. Co-Chair Report**

None

**VII. Public Comment**

None

**VIII. Membership**

Elaine Flores Subsequent Term Renewal Vote – VOTE

Council Members reviewed the "Marin Care Council Subsequent Term Application".

CM Malone made a motion to approve Elaine Flores for a subsequent term. CM Kelley seconded. There was no additional discussion.

Public Comment: None

A randomized roll call **vote** was conducted.

**AYES:** CM Bateman, CM Cronin, CM E.J. Flores, CM Frazier, CM Kasel, CM Kelley, CM Malone, CM Marcum.

**Noes:** None

**Abstain:** None

**Recuse:** None

**8-0-0-0**

Elaine J. Flores was unanimously approved for a subsequent term.

Membership Calendar

Council Support announced that Walter Kelley's term will be up for renewal in August 2013. If the Care Council plans not to meet in August, the renewal will need to be included on the July meeting agenda. The consensus was to vote on Walter Kelley's subsequent term at the July 10, 2013 meeting.

Public Comment: None

*5:10p.m. CM Dushon arrives.*

**IX. Community Outreach and Advocacy**

No business

Public Comment: None

**X. Division of Public Health Report**

S. Spaeth presented information on health care reform and the Affordable Care Act. Key dates noted: October 1, 2013 – start of open enrollment and January 1, 2014 – implementation date of the Affordable Care Act. In addition to the presentation, a handout titled "What Will Health Care Reform Bring in 2014" was distributed. The handout was prepared by Anne Donnelly from Project Inform and addressed specific health care reform information for Ryan White Clients.

C. Santini reported: 1.) The previously reported, Ryan White Part A FY2013-'14 award reduction has been recalculated and is now estimated to be a 14% decrease. A printout of an e-mail; subject, "Update of HHS Funding News" was distributed and it detailed, by percent, the causes for the funding decrease. Also distributed

was a spreadsheet showing the “estimated 14% reduction applied to all service categories equally” for the Marin 2013-’14 Ryan White Part A award. Announcement of the actual award is expected by the end of June 2013.

C. Emerson reported: 1.) The miscalculation in the Part A application of the “Hold Harmless” provision was made in FY2010 and “the error continued over the past several years”. “The good news is that they are not making anyone pay it back and only applying it to this year”. 2.) The Council may need an additional meeting in July. Once the FY2013-’14 Part A award is announced, the Council will need to revise the current year allocation. Also, before the end of July, the FY2014-’15 allocation will need to be completed by the Care Council.

Public Comment: None

#### **XI. Conflict of Interest Disclosure Statements**

The “Marin HIV/AIDS Care Council Conflict of Interest Disclosure Form” was distributed to, completed, and submitted by Council Members.

Council Members made verbal statements of Conflict of Interest for the record.

CM Bateman: Unaffiliated. County employee with a perceived Conflict of Interest.  
CM Cronin: Actual conflict of interest – All Service Categories, except Substance Abuse and Oral Health. Affiliated with Marin AIDS Project /Service Provider.  
CM Dushon: Unaffiliated  
CM E.J. Flores: Unaffiliated  
CM Frazier: Unaffiliated  
CM Kasel: Unaffiliated  
CM Kelley: Unaffiliated - Consumer  
CM Malone: Actual or perceived conflict of interest - All Service Categories. Executive Director of Marin AIDS Project.  
CM Marcum: Unaffiliated

Public Comment: None

#### **XII. Review of FY2014-’15 Prioritization and Allocation Process**

M. Schieble reported that Council Support conducted a Prioritization and Allocation training on May 29, 2013. CM Dushon and CM Kasel attended the training and “...received today’s information in advance and have had a little more time to work with it”.

C. Santini reviewed the handout, “Priority Setting and Allocation Process”.

Public Comment: None

#### **XIII. Review and Discussion of Service Category Data**

Public Comment: J. Ellermann announced a correction to “Marin County Ryan White FY2012/13 Service Category Summary Sheets”. Page 3, Category: Outpatient/Ambulatory Care was corrected to read, “Definition of unit of service: Encounters=1 medical appointment”. Hospital visit, or hospital emergency room visit was deleted. A 15 minutes medical appointment is equal to one unit of service. In other words, a 45 minute medical appointment would equal three units of service.

C. Santini projected and reviewed the, “Fiscal Year Time Line”. The start and finish date of each Part A and Part B fiscal year was reviewed, so all Council Members were clear on the timing when using the terms, “last year”, “this year [FY2013-’14], and “next year”. The handout, “Units of Service per Client by Service Category” for the Fiscal Year 2012-’13 was reviewed.

C. Santini listed and reviewed the data and Information sources that had been provided to Council Members.

- “Fiscal Year Time Line”
- “Units of Service per Client by Service Category”
- “Ryan White Service Category Definitions”
- “2014-’15 Marin HIV/AIDS Care Council Prioritization Worksheet and History”
- “14/15 Decision Matrix for Allocation of Ryan White Funding in Marin County”

- “Marin County-Ryan White FY2012/13 Service Category Summary Sheets”
- “HIV/AIDS in Marin County – an Epidemiological Profile” \*(3/27/13)
- “Service Category Presentation” *All Service Categories* \*(2/12/13, 3/27/13, 4/10/13, 5/10/13).
- “2012-13 Countywide Client Satisfaction Survey” \*(04/10/13).
- “Prioritization and Allocation Guiding Principles” \*(3/27/13 & 4/10/13).

CM Kasel voiced concern about the process stating, “...[with] new health care [reform] in January 2014, how can you make decisions with the unknown?” C. Santini encouraged Council Members to make decisions based on “what we know now” and document and agree on the assumptions that are being used for today’s decisions. CM Frazier commented, “We know that these cuts are coming”. CM Kelley added that the budget [Allocation] is reviewed quarterly. C. Santini reminded Council Members that the Prioritization and Allocation process was part of an annual cycle and the Allocation would be revisited.

Public Comment: None

#### **XIV. FY2014-'15 Service Category Prioritization – VOTE**

Column “A” “Priority Rank” of “14/15 Decision Matrix for Allocation of Ryan White Funding in Marin County” spreadsheet was referenced. The 2013-'14 priority ranking was also found on the “2014-'15 Marin HIV/AIDS Care Council Prioritization Worksheet and History” handout.

CM Kelley made a motion to keep the priority ranking the same [as the current ranking] for the FY2014-'15 Service Category Prioritization. CM Kasel seconded.

CM Kelley stated, “...it [the ranking] doesn’t really change from year to year”.

CM Bateman added, “...I’m Ok with keeping the priority ranking the way they are. What’s most important is how much money we designate for each program”. CM Bateman suggested consolidating the Emergency Financial Assistance, Food, and Medical Transportation Service Category funding and designing one program, which would eliminate administrative personnel costs.

Co-Chair Marcum recognized Cicily Emerson. C. Emerson stated, “I just want to remind the Council that a lot of those decisions about contracting and how services are provided are the job of the Grantee, which is us, the County.” “...your job is to allocate to the category and we will figure out the administration of it. We are thinking about those things and have had discussion of how to streamline... the Council does not have the ability, within its’ authority, to figure that out”. CM Bateman responded, “If we’re [the Council] imposing costs on the system by funding teeny tiny programs, I think we [the Council] should be warned about that”.

CM Kasel commented, “Looking at the contracts” “For example, I don’t think anybody’s ever seen a copy. It’s important that every Council Member review them and make recommendations”. Specifics from a Pharmaceutical contract were sighted. CM Kasel concluded, “If the Client has to take a cut every year in the sum of \$90,000 per year, then the Provider of the contract ought to take a cut too...it’s not fair. There is some room for efficiency within our contracts...”

M. Schieble requested that the Chair bring the meeting to order and limit the discussion to the motion on the floor, stating “I would remind the Chair and the Council that we have a motion to keep the prioritization the same and it has been seconded. I think getting distracted by a dollar conversation is not part of this agenda item. We are talking simply about the ranking of the priorities”.

Co-Chair Cronin called for a vote, however the discussion continued about contracts and Contractors.

CM E. J. Flores acknowledged, “[that]...we did get a little off track here, but I do agree...this issue should not be dismissed. We should go back and discuss it again.” Co-Chair Cronin summarized the discussion saying, “I think I’m hearing an issue about costs”. CM Kasel requested that the next meeting agenda include, “the discussion of contracts”. C. Emerson suggested that the Council Bylaws be reviewed and reiterated that the role of the Council was “about Allocation and Prioritization”. CM Bateman asked about the possibility of “a report on system implementations and administrative costs”. C. Santini stressed the need for the Council to follow the process and develop an Allocation. Without an Allocation, no analysis could be done.

6:27p.m. Point of Order

M. Schieble stated, "We have a motion on the floor to accept last years' Prioritization and it has been seconded. I'm going to request that the Chair, for Parliamentary purposes, restrict the comments to that motion". Co-Chair Cronin requested Public comment.

Public Comment: None

A randomized roll call **vote** was conducted.

**AYES:** CM Bateman, CM Cronin, CM Dushon, CM E.J. Flores, CM Frazier, CM Kasel, CM Kelley, CM Marcum.

**Noes:** None

**Abstain:** None

**Recuse:** CM Malone

**8-0-0-1**

The following Service Category Prioritization was approved for FY2014-'15.

**2014-'15 MARIN HIV/AIDS CARE COUNCIL PRIORITIZATION**

	<b>Service Category</b>	<b>2014-'15 Rank</b>
a.	<b>Outpatient /Ambulatory Health Care</b>	<b>1</b>
n.	<b>Case Management (Non-Medical)</b>	<b>2</b>
j.	<b>Mental Health Services</b>	<b>3</b>
l.	<b>Medical Case Management (including Treatment Adherence)</b>	<b>4</b>
q.	<b>Emergency Financial Assistance</b>	<b>5</b>
c.	<b>AIDS Pharmaceutical Assistance (local)</b>	<b>6</b>
g.	<b>Home Health Care (Nurse Case Management)</b>	<b>7</b>
h.	<b>Home and Community-based Health Services (Attendant Care)</b>	<b>7</b>
r.	<b>Food Bank/Home-delivered Meals (Gift Cards)</b>	<b>8</b>
d.	<b>Oral Health Care</b>	<b>9</b>
w	<b>Medical Transportation Services</b>	<b>10</b>
ad.	<b>Residential Substance Abuse Treatment</b>	<b>11</b>
m.	<b>Substance Abuse Treatment Services–Outpatient</b>	<b>12</b>

**XV. Next Steps – New Business**

Next Meeting: July 10, 2013, 4:30p.m. – Connection Center

There was continued discussion on the philosophy of Support Service Categories as a whole, adding to a Clients' quality of life and financial capacity. Program administration efficiencies and the impact to the Consumer were discussed.

Concern was voiced that the Care Council was not addressing the significant funding reduction in the current FY2013-'14 budget. CM Dushon asked if the review of contract administrative costs was under the scope of the Care Council. C. Emerson responded, "No. Your scope is the Service Category". CM E.J. Flores stated, "We are part of the EMA. San Mateo took cuts. San Francisco took cuts. We're part of it. We have to do the same".

**Next Step / To Do's**

- Agenda Item – Support Services philosophy for all support service categories.
- Agenda Item - Client education on money management.
- Agenda Item (August 2013) Community Forum planning or other outreach event planning.
- CE – E-mail to CM's "Resources" from SS's ACA PowerPoint.
- MJS – Facilitate WK subsequent term application.
- MJS – Update phone list / Member Directory

**XVI. Meeting Adjourned at 6:39p.m.**