



**Marin HIV/AIDS Care Council Meeting  
MINUTES**

**Wednesday, January 9, 2013**

**4:30p.m. - 6:30p.m.**

**899 Northgate Drive – 4<sup>th</sup> Floor Conference Room**

**San Rafael, CA 94903**

**[ Approved February 13, 2013 ]**

Larry Meredith, Ph.D.  
DIRECTOR

Margaret Kisliuk  
DIVISION DIRECTOR

HIV/AIDS Services

Community Health &  
Prevention Services  
899 Northgate Drive  
Suite 415  
San Rafael, CA 94903  
415 473 7590 T  
415 473 6266 F  
475 473 3232 TTY  
www.marincounty.org/hs

**Council Members Present:** Roy Bateman, Kevin Cronin, Trinity Dushon, Elaine J. Flores, James Frazier, Deborah Kasel, Jennifer Malone, Scott Marcum.

**Council Members Absent:** Saulo Bonagrazia(AE), Walter Kelley(AE).

**Staff Present:** Cicly Emerson, Chris Santini, Michael Schieble.

**Public:** Jami Ellermann, Debra Mullaney.

**I. Call to Order.**

Co-Chair Marcum called the meeting to order at 4:41p.m.

**II. Roll Call.**

Roll was called at 4:41p.m. and quorum was established with 7 of 10 Members present.

CM Dushon arrived at 4:44p.m. The meeting attendance increased to 8 of 10 Members present.

CM Bonagrazia(AE) was absent and excused. CM Kelley(AE) was absent and excused.

**III. Review and Approval of Agenda - VOTE**

CM E.J. Flores motioned to approve the agenda. CM Frazier seconded. A voice **vote** was conducted. All were in favor. No objections were heard. The agenda was approved.

**IV. Review and Approval of November 14, 2012 Minutes – VOTE**

CM E.J. Flores made motion to approve the November 14, 2012 minutes. CM Malone seconded.

A voice **vote** was conducted. All were in favor. No objections were heard. The minutes from the November 14, 2012 Marin Care Council meeting were approved.

*4:44p.m. CM Dushon arrives.*

**V. General Announcements**

CM Malone announced that on Friday, January 11, 2013, the Marin AIDS Project / M.A.P. will administer a survey on HIV and aging. Participants should be fifty years old or older. Contact M.A.P. to sign up.

CM Kasel announced: 1.) On February 14, 2013, Dominican University of California will participate in “One Billion Rising”, an event to bring awareness and demand an end to violence against women. [www.onebillionrising.org](http://www.onebillionrising.org) 2.) Benchmark Research is conducting a study for HIV+ individuals. Call Leigh 415-398-0173. Admission to the study is based on the medications a person is taking.

CM Dushon announced that he has a copy of a video which commemorates the 30<sup>th</sup> Anniversary of the AIDS Epidemic. The video will be available in February and could be used as a tool for outreach and awareness.

C. Santini reported that Meals of Marin closed their program on December 31, 2012.

**VI. Co-Chair Report**

None

**VII. Public Comment**

None

**VIII. Membership**

Approval of 2012 – 2<sup>nd</sup> Half Attendance Report – VOTE

Council Support distributed the July through December 2012 attendance report and requested that Council Members review their attendance to confirm that the report was accurate.

CM Frazier motioned to approve the 2012 – 2<sup>nd</sup> half Attendance Report. CM Bateman seconded. There were no corrections or objections to the attendance report. The 2012- 2<sup>nd</sup> half Attendance Report was approved.

Maria Reed

Co-Chair Marcum announced that Maria Reed, who was approved for Council Membership on October 10, 2012 has resigned. M. Reed had advised Council Support and the Co-Chairs that she was moving out of the area.

Public Comment: None.

**IX. Community Outreach and Advocacy**

World AIDS Day – December 1, 2012

Co-Chair Marcum reported that he had received coaching, developed some talking points about the Care Council, and contacted the Marin Independent Journal. The IJ profiled two M.A.P. Clients for World AIDS Day. Although the Care Council was proactive and provided information about the role of the Care Council, the information did not appear in print.

Public Comment: None.

**X. Division of Public Health Report**

C. Emerson reported: 1.) The San Francisco Council is conducting an EMA wide needs assessment for Latino MSM (men who have sex with men). The Marin focus group will be conducted in Spanish and facilitated by Enrique Asis and is scheduled for the end of January. The needs assessment report will include the results of a survey and specifics on access to care. 2.) Marin County is starting the second year of their HIV Prevention Grant and is partnered with the Marin AIDS Project. 3.) There has been discussion about moving the HHS – HIV Clinic. For the next 18 months there will be no change and the HHS – HIV Clinic will continue at the Wellness Campus.

C. Santini reported: On January 10, 2013, C. Emerson and C. Santini will present the Marin Jurisdictional Plan to the San Francisco HIV Prevention Planning Council. Discussion of a merger of the EMA’s San Francisco HIV Health Services Planning Council and the San Francisco Prevention Council has been mandated by Barbara Garcia, Director of Health, SFDPH .

Public Comment: None

**XI. Reallocation of Unspent Part A Funds FY2012-'13 – VOTE**

C. Santini distributed a handout titled, “2012-13 Ryan White Part A – Estimated Unspent Ryan White Funds” and commented that the Ryan White fiscal year would end in February 2013.

\$20,000 was estimated as unspent from the Mental Health Service Category and available for reallocation.

The following immediate needs were estimated:

- \$5,200 Oral Health (note: Out of money as of November 30, 2012)
- \$5,500 Emergency Fund (note: Out of money as of November 30, 2012)
- \$2,000 Transportation (note: Out of money as of December 31, 2012)

Discussion followed. CM Bateman voiced concern about gaps in services given the November and December “out of money” status. C. Emerson responded that the Programs bill quarterly and the data was reported after the November Care Council meeting. The Council did not meet in December, so the reallocation request was timely. CM Malone commented, that in the absence of Ryan White funding, Oral Health services would still be available to Clients. Fees would be based on a sliding scale based on income.

CM Frazier asked about the estimated balance of \$7,300 of unspent funds, once the immediate needs were covered. C. Santini responded, “We have some other things that, that money could be spent on. Pending is some information from San Francisco about how we can spend that money. There are uncovered personnel and operating costs that we could possibly get permission to spend that money on”. CM Kasel asked, “Why we are waiting for San Francisco?” C. Santini responded that a local exception was being sought, so Marin could override the administrative cost cap of ten percent. Alternatively, Food Cards could be purchased with the unspent funds. The 75%/25% requirement was considered.

Debra Mullaney from the County of Marin, Department of Health and Human Services – Dental Clinic was present and restated the request for additional Oral Health funds. It was confirmed that the request would fund the Dental Clinic’s needs through the end of the fiscal year. It was noted that the Dental Clinic does not charge an administration fee.

CM Kasel asked about the number of Clients that were served in the 3<sup>rd</sup> Quarter. The quarterly data (UDC, appointment/requests for service) was reviewed for each Service Category. CM Malone commented, “You asked what happens when there isn’t money. In our case [M.A.P.] we continue to serve people and take the money out of M.A.P’s reserves and we’re running about a \$90K deficit for the year”.

CM Bateman motioned to reduce the Mental Health Allocation by \$12,700 and reallocate the funds; \$5,200 to Oral Health, \$5,500 to Emergency Funds, and \$2,000 to Transportation. Reallocation of the estimated \$7,300 of unspent funds would be decided at the February 2013 meeting of the Care Council. CM Frazier seconded.

Public Comment: None

A roll call **vote** was conducted.

**AYES:** CM Bateman, CM Dushon, CM E.J. Flores, CM Frazier, CM Kasel, CM Marcum

**Noes:** None

**Recuse:** CM Cronin, CM Malone

**Abstain:** None

**6-0-2-0**

The reallocation of \$12,700 was approved.

## **XII. Presentation of Council Members Responsibilities**

Co-Chair Marcum presented a PowerPoint presentation titled, “Overview of Care Council Responsibilities”.

Following the presentation, the discussion included the concept of “maintenance of effort”. Marin County must continue a previously determined level of County support for Core and Support services every year. C. Emerson added, that Marin County does not charge an administrative fee for the Part A – Ryan White Grant funds.

Public Comment: None

## **XIII. Approval of 2013 Care Council Calendar – VOTE**

The handout titled, “Marin HIV/AIDS Care Council 2013 Calendar” was reviewed. Council meetings from February 2013 through June 2013, included Service Categories to review monthly, in preparation for the FY2014-’15 Allocation scheduled in July 2013.

A handout titled, “Service Category Presentation Template” accompanied the 2013 draft Calendar.

The Template detailed a systematic qualitative and quantitative framework for the discussion of each Service Category:

1. Provide the Ryan White definition of the service category.
2. Provide additional information if the definition doesn't encompass how this service is being provided in Marin.
3. Have staff in this service category describe how they spend their time and/or provide some examples of client cases (anonymously) that illustrate the services that clients receive. Indicate if the client case represents a high need client or a typical client. Or have clients themselves speak to the Council about their experiences with a service.
4. Indicate how much money is being spent on this service.
5. Describe how a unit of service is counted in the service category.
6. Describe how many clients have been served to date and how many units of service have been provided to date. (Include information on the frequency of the services received-what is the fewest number of units a client receives and the greatest number as well as how many units the majority of clients receive.)

The value of having Clients speak to the Council about their experiences with a service, [#3] was discussed in great detail. Council Members that favored this type of input thought it was an avenue to increase Public input. CM Kasel commented that it should be mandatory for a Client as part of receiving a service. Client testimonials would provide the human "what works" input in addition to statistical data.

CM Members opposed to this type of input thought that the avenue for Consumer input already exists, since Council meetings are open to the Public. The input would be from a small, unrepresentative sample of Clients. High needs Clients would not be able to participate and therefore would be unrepresented. The requirement would be an additional burden to Service Providers. The Council membership includes Clients, so the insights are currently represented.

Public Comment: Jami Ellermann commented, "I've been coming to the meetings for awhile...one of the things we've been trying to get at is a real explanation of what these Service Categories are. I do think that the Service Provider is in the best position to say what those are, but I do also think there is more need for focus groups. The Service Provider is best able to explain the broad range of services provided at that agency".

*6:25p.m. Point of Order*

*Council Members were in agreement to extended the meeting ten minutes and adjourn at 6:35p.m*

CM Kasel motioned to approve the "Marin HIV/AIDS Care Council 2013 Calendar" and "Service Category Presentation Template". CM EJ Flores seconded.

The **vote** was conducted by a show of hands.

**AYES:** CM Dushon, CM E.J. Flores, CM Frazier, CM Kasel, CM Marcum

**Noes:** CM Bateman, CM Cronin, CM Malone.

**Recuse:** None

**Abstain:** None

**5-3-0-0** 5/8= 62.5%

The motion did not pass. The "Marin HIV/AIDS Care Council 2013 Calendar" and "Service Category Presentation Template" were not approved.

CM Frazier motioned to approve the “Marin HIV/AIDS Care Council 2013 Calendar”. CM Malone seconded.

The **vote** was conducted by a show of hands.

**AYES:** CM Bateman, CM Cronin, CM Dushon, CM E.J. Flores, CM Frazier, CM Marcum, CM Malone.

**Noes:** CM Kasel

**Recuse:** None

**Abstain:** None

**7-1-0-0**

The “Marin HIV/AIDS Care Council 2013 Calendar” was approved.

**XIV. Discussion of Allocation Guiding Principles**

*Item tabled due to meeting time.*

**XV. Next Steps – New Business**

Next Meeting: February 13, 2013 – 899 Northgate 4<sup>th</sup> Floor Conference Room, 4:30p.m. – 6:30p.m.

**Next Step / To Do’s**

- Agenda Item – Develop guiding principles / logic for allocation decisions.
- Agenda Item – Support Services philosophy for all support service categories.
- Agenda Item – Discuss Service Categories per 2013 calendar.
- TD – Make available video, 30<sup>th</sup> Anniversary of the AIDS
- CE – Winter shelter resources for Transgender individuals.
- CE – Report specific needs assessment activities by the SF Council.
- CS – Report Marin maintenance of effort dollar amount to the Care Council.
- MJS – Facilitate SM subsequent term application.

**XVI. Meeting Adjourned at 6:33 p.m.**