



DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH AND HUMAN SERVICES

Larry Meredith, Ph.D., Director

DIVISION OF PUBLIC HEALTH
**COMMUNITY HEALTH &
PREVENTION SERVICES**

899 NORTHGATE DRIVE, SUITE 415
SAN RAFAEL, CA 94903
PHONE: (415) 473-4276
FAX: (415) 473-6266

Marin HIV/AIDS CARE Council Meeting Draft MINUTES

May 29, 2007

5:00-7:00 PM

899 Northgate, 4th Floor Conference Room

Members Present: Will Boemer, Elyse Graham, Wade Flores, Peter Hansen, Roy Bateman, Jennifer Malone, David Witt, Diva Berry

Members Absent: Lisa Becher, James Frazier

Staff Present: Sparkie Spaeth, Cicily Emerson, Chris Santini, Karen Kindig

Others Present: Brian Slattery, Pam Lynott, Kevin Cronin, Shawn Martin

I. Call to Order

Meeting called to order at 5:05 PM by CM Boemer.

II. Roll Call

CM Becher and CM Frazier were absent. CM Witt called in and listened on speaker phone at 5:20 PM and then came in at 6:00 PM. CM Berry arrived late, at 5:35 PM. Each member present stated whether or not they had a conflict of interest: CM Boemer - volunteer at MAP; CM Hansen - none; CM Flores - none; CM Malone - Director of MAP; CM Bateman - County of Marin employee (CDA)/administers CDBG (HOPWA)/UC is employer of co-owner of his house; CM Graham - none.

III. Review and Approval of Agenda

CM Graham motioned to approve the Agenda and CM Flores seconded. Vote was done by show of hands. The Agenda was approved.

AYES: CM Boemer, CM Graham, CM Hansen, CM Flores, CM Bateman, CM Malone

IV. General Announcements

- a. CM Malone: A forum, sponsored by a pharmaceutical company, coordinated through MAP, will be held at lunch time on 6/19/07 at San Rafael Joe's.
- b. CM Boemer: Marin Life Plus will hold a semi-annual retreat, "Summer Camp II," at Marin Headlands Institute in Sausalito, 6/1-6/3/07. Contact Alan Breslaw for more info: alan@marinaidsproject.org or 457-2487, x107.
- c. CM Flores: SF HIV Planning Council Community Outreach & Advocacy Committee will have Town Hall meeting at the SF LGBT Center on 5/31/07.

V. Public Comment

- a. Brian Slattery (MTC): He has studied the reduction scenarios submitted by the County and can see no scenario where the system of care will not be decimated. Only the County of Marin has the ability to supplement funding. Both San Francisco and Oakland are supplemented by County funding. He advocates asking the Board of Supervisors and DHHS to consider this.
- b. Shawn Martin: He is shocked that a discussion is not happening around this. His grandparents came to work in the Marin City shipyards in 1939 and they and their community all pooled their resources together to help each other out in hard times. No one in Marin County with HIV/AIDS should go without help. The services MAP supplies are so important. He appeals to the Board of Supervisors and to the public to help MAP continue providing these services.

VI. Co-Chairs Report

There was no Co-Chairs Report.

VII. Division of Public Health Report

Sparkie Spaeth reported:

The Title I award was reduced significantly. The award is divided into two sections this year: formula and supplemental. The formula award is based on the number of people living with AIDS and is only slightly different from last year. San Francisco wrote a grant for the supplemental award and only got \$4 million instead of the \$12 million they got last year, which is a 36% reduction. Most other EMAs only had 10% reductions. A third application for a grant is being submitted this week - the County of Marin has requested \$150,000 (\$38,000 for outreach) from the Minority AIDS Initiative for outreach and services to minorities living with HIV/AIDS. At least \$10,000 is expected. The award amount will be known in August. There is no guarantee, SF is confident, since it has gotten this money in the past. The County will backfill for clinical services (i.e. Specialty Clinic) from General Fund. County budget hearings will be in June, so letters to Supervisors should be written ASAP. The first step would be to have a meeting with HHS Department Head, Larry Meredith, which Sparkie will facilitate in getting.

CM Malone: "My level of confidence in San Francisco's judgment about how much money might come in is fairly low at this particular moment and I'm not sure that San Francisco could make a compelling case in a competitive bid for a minority AIDS initiative, compared to many other communities I can think of that probably would be applying for this money also. I have no idea how much money is available or, again, what the criteria are, but just based on numbers... I feel very strongly that we need to take action. I would hope that H&HS would join us in making a strong request, because, even if the best case scenario is that this Minority AIDS Initiative might get funded, given the timeframe and so forth, various other kinds of decisions would have needed to be made before that ever happened. And, I appreciate that there's a way to salvage Primary Care out the County's budget, but we have a community-based system of care that is at risk of just crumbling here if something doesn't happen."

CM Flores requested that the Council start drafting a letter to the BOS, since it needs to be in by June.

CM Malone thinks the Council should go further and meet with the "key players."

CM Bateman stated that the County does have a lobbyist in Washington the Council could request that the lobbyist be asked to do whatever would be helpful in Nancy Pelosi's effort to restore funding to levels similar to last year's. The Council could prepare a letter for the BOS to send to whoever in Congress would be appropriate and also to HRSA. The Council could request that the BOS fund the gap for the next 8 months. Perhaps the Marin Community Foundation might be willing to fund some of it, although the County would probably have to be the primary source.

CM Boemer thinks that the Council needs to do something as quickly as possible and bring in other partners because everyone is going to be affected by this.

CM Graham requested that an action step be taken and asked who would like to participate in writing the letters. CM Graham, CM Flores, CM Boemer, CM Malone, CM Bateman, CM Berry along with Brian Slattery, Kevin Cronin, Shawn Martin, all volunteered. (CM Flores also volunteered Dorothy Kleffner on her behalf.)

Public Comment: 1) *Brian Slattery:* By his estimate, even if Primary Care is funded by County backfill, the funds will be about \$200,000 short. \$10,000 for Outreach is sort of ludicrous if there's no one to do the work. There will be a loss of case managers, since their hours will be cut so drastically. Now is not the time to write polite a letter. This should not wait until July. This is an emergency. The Council should go to the Marin IJ for publicity, in order to mobilize the public, and should meet with the Supervisors individually. Marin Community Foundation will not pick up, on short notice, what the government's not funding. Marin County is richest county in California. The money is here. The Council needs to cause AIDS to be a priority. This is a really urgent situation. 2) *Shawn Martin:* This is a critical issue. We need to see how pressure affects the community. We should use publicity, e.g. TV 50, Marin IJ, etc., to make people aware. Give the community a choice to speak up at Board of Supervisors meetings to let the Supervisors know that this is a priority. This issue should not be tip-toed around, but handled with human consideration. Inform the public.

VIII. Review Changes in HRSA Service Categories

Chris Santini reported:

The categories of Complementary Care and Volunteer Companion services are being eliminated. Benefits Counseling is no longer a service category, but the services will be considered non-medical case management. She met with Amira from Marin AIDS Interfaith Network (MAIN), contractor for acupuncture, and was told that most of the money allocated to them has already been spent. They will not be able to offer services in June and have notified acupuncturists and clients.

IX. Discussion and VOTE on Reductions in the 07-08 Budget

Cicity Emerson explained Reduction Scenarios #1, #2, and Alternate Approach (see Attachment 1). Scenario #1 took original percentages (that the Council had allocated on 2/7/07) and reduced everything equally (by 34%). Scenario #2 is no longer usable because it was made before the 75-25% HRSA mandate came down. The Alternative Approach is where one could just look at what is left for the next 8 months and re-allocate within that amount.

CM Graham requested that the Council have a discussion about what categories are the most important and what are the least important.

After some discussion, CM Graham motioned to eliminate remaining funding (\$1,865) for Council Support and was seconded by CM Witt. CM Flores asked if the Council shouldn't consider taking a percentage off the top of the award to be used for Council Support, like San Francisco does. CM Bateman said that, if Council Support is cut, that the Minutes taken by County staff should be less detailed (and therefore less time consuming) than they have been. CM Boemer commented that there is a requirement that the Council have minutes/records kept.

Public Comment: 1) *Cicity Emerson:* If Council Support funding were to be eliminated, the current level of minute-taking will not be maintained. Subcommittee meeting minutes will need to be taken by Committee members, instead of County staff. San Francisco sets aside \$300,000 for Council Support. If the Council decides to eliminate Council Support, she would recommend that the Council become an Advisory Group instead, and meet less often.

CM Berry stated that, if the Council plans to give quality service, including providing minutes to the community, funds most definitely need to be available to have a person with qualifications to take the minutes. It would be ludicrous to say, for instance, "Diva, you come in this day and do the minutes and the next time Wade will do them." And then, if Wade has to go to the hospital on that day, who's going to do the minutes? They need to be done reliably and correctly. CM Malone said she feels that the total picture needs to be seen more clearly, in order to make better a decision on what to cut. It's hard to just start with one item, especially such a "small ticket" item.

A roll call vote was taken. The motion to eliminate funding for Council Support did not pass. (66% is needed to pass)

AYES: CM Boemer, CM Graham, CM Witt, CM Hansen, CM Bateman (62.5%)

NOES: CM Flores, CM Berry

RECUSE: CM Malone

Discussion continued and requests for clarification were made about how much money is actually remaining to be re-allocated. Sparkie Spaeth reminded the Council that 30-day notices needed to be given to providers if their contracts were to be cancelled due to funding cuts.

CM Malone stated that she feels that it is an impossible task to try to make these allocation decisions in the 25 minutes remaining, especially when trying to put together a clear format that each member could look at. She felt that it couldn't be properly done today, in light of the huge consequence of whatever decisions would be made.

CM Bateman stated that he would really like the Council to make some progress today. He has already put a scenario together that he would like to share. He would like to go through the allocations service by service and come up with numbers for each.

CM Berry said she thinks it would be easier to look each category and adjust percentages. CM Malone stated that she does not agree.

CM Graham asked what the Council felt would be the best use of the remaining 17 minutes, since some members had voiced their discomfort with how the process was going and there didn't seem to be sufficient data to make an acceptable decision.

After hearing input from the Council, CM Berry motioned to extend the meeting until 7:30 PM, seconded by CM Flores.

Public Comment: 1) *Kevin Cronin*: He wondered if there is any way to approach providers to ask them to waive their 30-day notice requirement in order to give more time for the Council to make a decision. (Sparkie said she would check with County Counsel.)

A roll call vote was taken. The motion to extend the meeting until 7:30 PM passed.

AYES: CM Boemer, CM Graham, CM Witt, CM Hansen, CM Bateman, CM Flores, CM Malone, CM Berry

CM Witt motioned to use reserve funds that were previously allocated for food to fund transportation and have food services provided as a cards (using the gift cards from Safeway and Trader Joe's that were pre-bought with 06-07 funds) rather than from actual providers. This was seconded by CM Flores. CM Graham proposed an amendment to the motion: Take transportation off and use remaining \$4,160 plus half of the other funds, for a total of \$13,660, and just deal with the food. CM Malone asked to make this clearer. CM Graham responded: The only funding for food would be the remaining cards and the remaining \$9,500 from last year's unspent funds to purchase more food gift cards (a total of \$13,660 allocated for food, in the form of food gift cards). This amended motion was seconded by CM Flores.

Public Comment: None

A roll call vote was taken. The (above) motion passed.

AYES: CM Boemer, CM Graham, CM Witt, CM Hansen, CM Bateman, CM Flores, CM Berry
RECUSE: CM Malone

CM Graham motioned to continue the meeting on 6/6/07 at 4:30 PM, seconded by CM Witt.

Public Comment: None

A roll call vote was taken. The motion to continue the meeting on 6/6/07 passed.

AYES: CM Boemer, CM Graham, CM Witt, CM Hansen, CM Bateman, CM Flores, CM Malone, CM Berry

X. New Business/Next Steps/Next Agenda Items

- a. Continue: Discussion and VOTE on Reductions in the 07-08 Budget

XI. Meeting Adjourned at 7:30 PM

ATTACHMENT 1

REDUCTION SCENARIO #1 = 34% REDUCTIONS IN ALL CATEGORIES BASED ON PERCENTAGES VOTED ON BY THE COUNCIL ON February 7th, 2007									
A	B	C	D	E	F	G	H	I	J
Category Status	Tier	Priority order	Service Categories	Original Percentage	Original Projected Dollar Amount*	Reduced at Same %**	Projected Contract Expenditure through June 30 2007	Remaining Dollars for 7/1/07-2/28/08	Unallocated Dollars
CORE	1	1	Primary Medical Care	20.59%	\$ 200,000	\$ 139,431	\$ (41,667)	\$ 97,764	
CORE	1	2	Mental Health	8.75%	\$ 85,000	\$ 59,258	\$ (16,667)	\$ 42,591	
NON-CORE	1	3	Non Medical Case Management (Advocacy & Benefits Counseling)	10.30%	\$ 100,000	\$ 69,716	\$ (29,167)	\$ 40,549	
CORE	1	4	Case Management	27.28%	\$ 265,000	\$ 184,746	\$ (77,500)	\$ 107,246	
CORE	1	5	Home Health - Attendant and Professional Care	8.24%	\$ 80,000	\$ 55,772	\$ (24,080)	\$ 31,692	
CORE	1	6	Outpatient Substance Abuse Treatment	4.58%	\$ 44,518	\$ 31,036	\$ (20,000)	\$ 11,036	
CORE	1	7	Oral Health	4.39%	\$ 42,662	\$ 29,742	\$ (10,000)	\$ 19,742	
CORE	2	8	Direct Emergency Financial Assistance-Pharmaceuticals	1.16%	\$ 11,285	\$ 7,867	\$ (7,893)	\$ (26)	
NON-CORE	2	8	Direct Emergency Financial Assistance-\$	0.65%	\$ 6,321	\$ 4,407	\$ (4,440)	\$ (33)	
NON-CORE	2	9	Food	5.66%	\$ 55,000	\$ 38,344	\$ (21,100)	\$ 17,244	
ELIMINATED	2	10	Complementary Therapies - Acupuncture	2.99%	\$ 29,000	\$ 20,217	\$ (13,333)	\$ 6,884	
NON-CORE	2	11	Transportation	0.41%	\$ 4,000	\$ 2,789	\$ (2,667)	\$ 122	
ELIMINATED	2	12	Buddy / Companion / Volunteer	3.09%	\$ 30,000	\$ 20,915	\$ (16,667)	\$ 4,248	
NON-CORE	2	13	Vitamins	0.31%	\$ 3,000	\$ 2,091	\$ (3,900)	\$ (1,809)	
NON-CORE	3	14	Outreach	0.93%	\$ 9,000	\$ 6,274	\$ -	\$ 6,274	
OTHER	3	17	Planning Council Support	0.67%	\$ 6,500	\$ 4,532	\$ (2,667)	\$ 1,865	
			TOTALS	100.00%	\$ 971,286	\$ 677,137	\$ 291,748	\$ 374,257	\$ 11,132
					**actual award=	\$ 677,137			
					CORE 75%	\$ 507,853			
					NON-CORE 25%	\$ 169,284			
A	CORE medical categories must make up 75% of the total award. NON-CORE support services can only be 25%. OTHER is neither, but Marin has put it with NON-CORE								
F	\$971,286 this is 5% of last years total award which was \$1,022,406 (40,000 was returned to SF, and 982,406 was spent by the County)								
G	Original allocation percentage multiplied by the current award								
H	Projected expenses from contractors through June 30th based on 4 months of spending of last year's contracted amount divided by 12								
I	Remaining allocations for each category for the 8 month period of July 1st 2007-February 28th, 2008								
J	Unallocated dollars which were allocated for acupuncture & buddy companion (less overspending), need to be distributed in the NON-CORE services								

ATTACHMENT 1

REDUCTION SCENARIO #2 = ELIMINATE TIER 3, REDUCE TIER 2 BY 20%, BECAUSE OF 75/25 CORE REMAINS THE SAME AND FUNDS NEED TO BE REDISTRIBUTED IN NON-CORE (Scenario voted on by the council before 75/25 was implemented)

A	B	C	D	E	F	G	H	I	J	
Category Status	Tier	Priority order	Service Categories	Original %	Original Dollar Amt*	Reduced for CORE add'l 20% for NON-CORE	Projected Contract Expenditure thru June 30 2007	Remaining Dollars for 7/1/07-2/28/08	Funds to be redistributed- less overspending	
CORE	1	1	Primary Medical Care	20.59%	\$ 200,000	\$ 139,431	\$ (41,667)	\$ 97,764		
CORE	1	2	Mental Health	8.75%	\$ 85,000	\$ 59,258	\$ (16,667)	\$ 42,591		
NON-CORE	1	3	Non Medical Case Management (Advocacy & Benefits Counseling)	10.30%	\$ 100,000	\$ 69,716	\$ (29,167)	\$ 40,549		
CORE	1	4	Case Management	27.28%	\$ 265,000	\$ 184,746	\$ (77,500)	\$ 107,246		
CORE	1	5	Home Health - Attendant and Professional Care	8.24%	\$ 80,000	\$ 55,772	\$ (24,080)	\$ 31,692		
CORE	1	6	Outpatient Substance Abuse Treatment	4.58%	\$ 44,518	\$ 31,036	\$ (20,000)	\$ 11,036		
CORE	1	7	Oral Health	4.39%	\$ 42,662	\$ 29,742	\$ (10,000)	\$ 19,742		
CORE	2	8	Direct Emergency Financial Assistance-Pharmaceuticals	1.16%	\$ 11,285	\$ 7,867	\$ (7,893)	\$ (26)		
NON-CORE	2	8	Direct Emergency Financial Assistance-\$	0.65%	\$ 6,321	\$ 3,526	\$ (4,440)	\$ (914)		
NON-CORE	2	9	Food	5.66%	\$ 55,000	\$ 30,675	\$ (21,100)	\$ 9,575		
ELIMINATED	2	10	Complementary Therapies - Acupuncture	2.99%	\$ 29,000		\$ (13,333)	\$ (13,333)		
NON-CORE	2	11	Transportation	0.41%	\$ 4,000	\$ 2,231	\$ (2,667)	\$ 436		
ELIMINATED	2	12	Buddy / Companion / Volunteer	3.09%	\$ 30,000	\$ -	\$ (16,667)	\$ (16,667)		
NON-CORE	2	13	Vitamins	0.31%	\$ 3,000	\$ 1,672	\$ (3,900)	\$ (2,228)		
NON-CORE	3	14	Outreach	0.93%	\$ 9,000	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -		
OTHER	3	17	Planning Council Support	0.67%	\$ 6,500	\$ -	\$ (2,667)	\$ (2,667)		
			TOTALS	100.00%	\$ 971,286	\$ 642,510	\$ 291,748	\$ 324,796	\$ 25,966	
					**actual award=	\$ 677,137				
LEGEND					CORE 75%	\$ 507,853				
					NON-CORE 25%	\$ 169,284				
A	CORE medical categories must make up 75% of the total award. NON-CORE support services can only be 25%. OTHER is neither, but Marin has put it with NON-CORE									
F	\$971,286 this is 5% of last years total award which was \$1,022,406 (40,000 was returned to SF, and 982,406 was spent by the County)									
G	Using current award amount, eliminate tier 3 and non fundable categories, reduce remaining categories in tier 2 by 20%- column J shows funding to be redistributed									
H	Projected expenses from contractors through June 30th based on 4 months of spending of last year's contracted amount divided by 12									
I	Remaining allocations for each category for the 8 month period of July 1st 2007-February 28th, 2008									
J	Unallocated dollars because they cannot be put back into tier 1, they need to be distributed in the NON-CORE services to comply with 75-25									

note=some dollar amounts may not add up perfectly due to rounding

ATTACHMENT 1

ALTERNATE APPROACH- LOOK AT WHAT IS LEFT AFTER CURRENT PROJECTED EXPENDITURES AND REDISTRIBUTE WITHIN 75/25									
A	B	C	D	E	F	G	H	I	
Category Status	Tier	Priority order	Service Categories	Total Contract Amount	Projected Contract Expenditure through June 30 2007	Total Award Remaining	Core Allocations	Non Core Allocations	
CORE	1	1	Primary Medical Care		\$ (41,667)				
CORE	1	2	Mental Health		\$ (16,667)				
NON-CORE	1	3	Non Medical Case Management (Advocacy & Benefits Counseling)		\$ (29,167)				
CORE	1	4	Case Management		\$ (77,500)				
CORE	1	5	Home Health - Attendant and Professional Care		\$ (24,080)				
CORE	1	6	Outpatient Substance Abuse Treatment		\$ (20,000)				
CORE	1	7	Oral Health		\$ (10,000)				
CORE	2	8	Direct Emergency Financial Assistance-Pharmaceuticals		\$ (7,893)				
NON-CORE	2	8	Direct Emergency Financial Assistance-\$		\$ (4,440)				
NON-CORE	2	9	Food		\$ (21,100)				
ELIMINATED	2	10	Complementary Therapies - Acupuncture		\$ (13,333)				
NON-CORE	2	11	Transportation		\$ (2,667)				
ELIMINATED	2	12	Buddy / Companion / Volunteer		\$ (16,667)				
NON-CORE	2	13	Vitamins		\$ (3,900)				
NON-CORE	3	14	Outreach		\$ -				
OTHER	3	17	Planning Council Support		\$ (2,667)				
			TOTALS	\$ 677,137	\$ (291,748)	\$ 385,389	\$ 310,046	\$ 75,343	
A	CORE medical categories must make up 75% of the total award; NON-CORE support services can only be 25%. OTHER is neither, but Marin has put it with NON-CORE								
F	Projected expenses from contractors through June 30th based on 4 months of spending of last year's contracted amount divided by 12								
G	Column for total=must add up to 385,389, intentionally left blank								
I	Working Column for CORE services=must add up to \$ 310,046								
J	Working Column for NON-CORE services, must add up to \$ 75,343								