



DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH AND HUMAN SERVICES

Larry Meredith, Ph.D., Director

DIVISION OF PUBLIC HEALTH
**COMMUNITY HEALTH &
PREVENTION SERVICES**

899 NORTHGATE DRIVE, SUITE 415
SAN RAFAEL, CA 94903
PHONE: (415) 473-4276
FAX: (415) 473-6266

**Marin HIV/AIDS CARE Council Meeting
Draft MINUTES
June 6, 2007
4:30 - 6:30p.m.
899 Northgate, 4th Floor Conference Room**

Council Members Present: Roy Bateman, Diva Berry, Will Boemer, Wade Flores, James Frazier, Elyse Graham, Jennifer Malone, David Witt

Council Members Absent: Lisa Becher (Leave of Absence), Peter Hansen

Staff Present: Cicily Emerson, Chris Santini, Michael Schieble, Sparkie Spaeth

Public: Pam Lynott, Walter Kelly, Brian Slattery

I. Call to Order

Meeting called to order at 5:09p.m. by CM Boemer.

II. Roll Call

Quorum was established with 8 of 10 Council Members present.

CM Becher is on a Leave of Absence. CM Hansen was absent without communication. CM Malone stated she would participate in the discussion, but recuse from all budget votes because of conflict of interest as the Director of the Marin AIDS Project (MAP).

III. Review and Approval of Agenda

The approval of the agenda was waived. The business on the agenda is the continuation of the approved May 29, 2007 agenda.

IV. General Announcements

None

V. Public Comment

None

VI. Division of Public Health Report

S. Spaeth announced that Larry Meredith plans to attend the June 13, 2007 Care Council Meeting. He has requested that the Council present at that meeting the reduction scenarios. These scenarios detail what the CARE Council service categories would be with a reduction of \$300K, \$200K, \$150K, \$100K, and \$50K in the budget. Attachment #1 (e-mail).

CM Boemer stated that he was impressed with Larry's level of support and was encouraged that he was asking for the scenarios. CM Malone commented that she thought "we worked well as a group [05/29/07 meeting] and felt everyone was well prepared." CM Bateman stated that Brian Slattery was very helpful.

Public Comment: None

VII. Discussion and VOTE on reductions in 07-08 budget

A. A general discussion ensued to decide the best way to develop the process to be used to produce different budget scenarios. CM Malone stated that since we have no process, each service category should be considered line by line or a 33% reduction could be applied to reduce each category. CM Bateman stated that, "we need to present San Francisco with a total budget, which included what we have actually spent". CM Witt suggested that we create a budget with the actual award. CM Flores and CM Boemer commented that the group needs to go categorically.

Point of Order: CM Witt stated that "every suggestion is not a motion." That would require that we vote on each idea of how to do the process.

Note: CM Frazier leaves at 5:46p.m.

It was agreed that the meeting would proceed as a workgroup looking at each Service Category line by line. An Excel spreadsheet was projected (Attachment #2 - "Updated Reference Sheet 6-6-07") and updated with each vote to see the change in the total. The first scenario developed would be based on the current award, budget funding of \$677,137.

CM Flores asked if we will have public comment on each category. CM Boemer said yes, that had been stated that it would be the process at the last meeting.

CM Graham asked the group to take a straightforward approach. She listened to the tape and the group spent sixty minutes on discussing the process at the last meeting, "let's just try one and get started and see how it goes".

Primary Medical Care: CM Witt suggested \$130,000 (aka \$130K). CM Bateman suggested \$170K stating that, that is what the clinic needed.

CM Witt made motion to fund primary care at \$130K. CM Graham seconded.

Public Comment: B Slattery stated that it was not necessary when the clinic had asked for \$125K.

Vote:

Ayes: CM Bateman, CM Berry, CM Boemer, CM Flores, CM Graham, CM Witt.

Noes: none

Recuse: CM Malone

Mental Health: CM Malone stated that she has a conflict of interest as a Provider, but it's important to consider that all of MAP's actual expenditures are understated.

CM Flores made motion to fund mental health at \$65K. CM Graham seconded.

Public Comment: None

Vote:

Ayes: CM Bateman, CM Berry, CM Boemer, CM Flores, CM Graham, CM Witt.

Noes: none

Recuse: CM Malone

Case Management: CM Malone stated that this is the area that serves severe needs clients. It is important to look at units of service.

CM Bateman made motion to fund case management at \$180K. CM Graham seconded.

Public Comment: B. Slattery stated that this category is most likely to impact care.

Vote:

Ayes: CM Bateman, CM Berry, CM Boemer, CM Flores, CM Graham, CM Witt.

Noes: none

Recuse: CM Malone

Home Health: There was a short discussion about the service and Dr. Witt proposed reducing the service.

CM Bateman made motion to fund home health attendant at \$61K. CM Graham seconded.

Public Comment: 1.) B. Slattery send back to the funding source that created it that it was brought to you in abundance and the funding source that had been funding it was under stress and I cannot believe that you are not under and equal amount of stress. 2.) C. Emerson stated that this was important service in that it glues services together for people who are dying, and would discourage the council from doing anything drastic.

Vote:

Ayes: CM Bateman, CM Berry, CM Boemer, CM Flores, CM Graham, CM Witt.

Noes: none

Recuse: CM Malone

Substance Abuse: CM Graham stated that she was concerned that the cuts in this area were too severe.

CM Witt made motion to fund substance abuse at \$35K. CM Flores seconded.

Public Comment: 1.) B. Slattery stated that without residential the only thing to offer people is outpatient. 2.) P. Lynott stated that the budget should not be decreased and kept at \$50K.

Vote:

Ayes: CM Bateman, CM Berry, CM Boemer, CM Flores, CM Graham, CM Witt.

Noes: none

Recuse: CM Malone

Oral Health: CM Flores commented that this was an area that had very little outreach to the Latino Community. CM Graham agreed with CM Flores and shares his concern. CM Barry suggested that the client could be referred to other Federal programs. CM Witt noted that this was for non-urgent procedures.

CM Witt made motion to fund oral health care at \$12K. CM Bateman seconded.

Public Comment: 1.) C, Emerson stated that this was for adults that have gaps for DentalCAL 2.) P. Lynott stated that the DentalCAL program fills the need.

Vote:

Ayes: CM Bateman, CM Berry, CM Boemer, CM Flores, CM Graham, CM Witt.

Noes: none

Recuse: CM Malone

Direct Emergency (Medications): CM Boemer noted that this was a payer of last resort. The funds were used when ADAP, MediCare, and MediCAL are completely used. CM Witt commented that there are new meds coming that will cost at least \$25K per year and they won't be on the formulary.

CM Flores made motion to fund direct emergency at \$12K. CM Barry seconded.

Public Comment: None

Vote:

Ayes: CM Bateman, CM Berry, CM Boemer, CM Flores, CM Graham, CM Witt.
Noes: none
Recuse: CM Malone

CM Graham noted that completed the 75% “core” mandate services with a subtotal of \$494K.

Non Medical Case Management: CM Bateman suggested amount of \$89K.

CM Graham made motion to fund management at \$100K. CM Witt seconded.

Public Comment: P. Lynott commented that it would be “wonderful to keep at the original amount”.

Vote:

Ayes: CM Bateman, CM Berry, CM Boemer, CM Flores, CM Graham, CM Witt.
Noes: none
Recuse: CM Malone

Direct Emergency – Financial:

CM Witt made motion to fund direct emergency at \$10K. CM Graham seconded.

Public Comment: W. Kelley- “That’s good”.

Vote:

Ayes: CM Bateman, CM Berry, CM Boemer, CM Flores, CM Graham, CM Witt.
Noes: none
Recuse: CM Malone

Food: CM Malone requested clarification on the category. CM Graham recapped that \$13K had been spent in food cards. Also consider that we will be eliminating transportation.

CM Flores made motion to fund food in the amount of \$38K. CM Witt seconded.

Public Comment: C. Santini reported the \$13k has been spent and to consider 3 cards for 8 months for 200 clients.

Vote:

Ayes: CM Bateman, CM Berry, CM Boemer, CM Flores, CM Graham, CM Witt.
Noes: none
Recuse: CM Malone

Transportation: CM Witt the buddy system program will be effected.

CM Flores made motion to fund transportation at \$3K. CM Bateman seconded.

Public Comment: P. Lynott suggested that the “Whistle Stop” service was available as an alternative. It cost \$2 each way, so \$4 for a round trip to the doctor, or \$5 to San Francisco.

Vote:

Ayes: CM Bateman, CM Berry, CM Boemer, CM Flores, CM Graham, CM Witt.
Noes: none
Recuse: CM Malone

Vitamins: CM Witt commented with the food card the decision making process is put in the hands of the client.

CM Flores made motion not to fund vitamins. The amount would be \$0. CM Bateman seconded by saying, “reluctantly second”.

Public Comment: None

Vote:

Ayes: CM Bateman, CM Berry, CM Boemer, CM Flores, CM Graham, CM Witt.

Noes: none

Recuse: CM Malone

Outreach: CM Witt made motion to fund outreach at \$0K. CM Graham seconded.

Public Comment: S.Spaeth noted that there is the possibility of getting outside funding through a grant for \$39K.

Vote:

Ayes: CM Bateman, CM Berry, CM Boemer, CM Flores, CM Graham, CM Witt.

Noes: none

Recuse: CM Malone

Council Support: CM Witt made motion to fund council support at \$3K. CM Flores seconded.

Public Comment: None

Vote:

Ayes: CM Bateman, CM Berry, CM Boemer, CM Flores, CM Graham, CM Witt.

Noes: none

Recuse: CM Malone

Meeting time: 6:56p.m. C. Emerson stated that we need to increase “Core Services” to meet the 75%-25% ratio. The budget total amount is correct, however the ratio is not. We will need to review the 75% [categories] Primary Medical Care, Mental Health, Case Management (Medical), Home Health Attendant, Outpatient Substance Abuse, Oral Health, and Direct Emergency (Medications).

Point of Order: Meeting past scheduled time.

CM Malone made motion to extend meeting time to 7:30p.m. CM Flores seconded.

Public Comment: none

Vote:

Ayes: CM Bateman, CM Berry, CM Boemer, CM Flores, CM Graham, CM Malone, CM Witt.

Noes: none

Abstain: none

Primary Medical Care: CM Bateman suggested \$170K. CM Graham suggested \$136K.

CM Barry made motion to fund primary medical care at \$138K. CM Bateman seconded.

Public Comment: None

Vote:

Ayes: CM Bateman, CM Berry, CM Boemer, CM Flores, CM Graham, CM Malone, CM Witt.

Noes: none

Recuse: CM Malone

Direct Emergency Financial (Medications):

CM Flores made motion to fund emergency financial at \$14,853. CM Barry seconded.

Public Comment: 1. W. Kelley, "wonderful". 2.) P. Lynott, "great".

Vote:

Ayes: CM Bateman, CM Berry, CM Boemer, CM Flores, CM Graham, CM Malone, CM Witt.

Noes: none

Recuse: CM Malone

C. Emerson summarized that the "core" percentage was correct and due to the changes there was re-work needed in the "non-core" amounts to get the total correct.

Food:

CM Witt made motion to fund food in the amount of \$34,500K. CM Flores seconded.

Public Comment: P. Lynott stated that there was food support available at the Ritter House.

Vote:

Ayes: CM Bateman, CM Berry, CM Boemer, CM Flores, CM Graham, CM Witt.

Noes: none

Recuse: CM Malone

Non Medical Case Management: CM Graham made motion to fund management at \$88.5K. CM Witt seconded.

Public Comment: None

Vote:

Ayes: CM Bateman, CM Berry, CM Boemer, CM Flores, CM Graham, CM Witt.

Noes: none

Recuse: CM Malone

Call the Question:

CM Graham called the question; to accept the total and give final approval to the updated spreadsheet; column "I" labeled "Current Allocation". CM Witt seconded.

Public Comment: None

Vote: Roll call vote was taken.

Ayes: CM Bateman, CM Berry, CM Boemer, CM Flores, CM Graham, CM Witt.

Noes: none

Recuse: CM Malone (per tape: yes in roll call vote).

B. An open discussion ensued about the proposals that would be needed to satisfy the request that the CARE Council present "reduction scenarios". "These scenarios detail what the CARE Council service categories would be with a reduction of \$300K, \$200K, \$150K, \$100K, and \$50K in the budget." CM Graham stated that Proposal #1 would be that the County maintain the level of original budgeted care with additional funding. CM Witt agreed with CM Graham. CM Witt suggested Proposal #2 as spreadsheet column "C" labeled "Original Projected Dollar Amount", adding, "we need to ask that the original level of care be restored". CM Bateman noted, "that would include the buddy companion and acupuncture".

Meeting time: 7:32p.m.

Point of Order: Meeting past scheduled time.

CM Witt made motion to extend meeting time to 7:40p.m. CM Barry seconded.

Public Comment: none

Vote:

Ayes: CM Bateman, CM Berry, CM Boemer, CM Flores, CM Graham, CM Malone, CM Witt.

Noes: none

Abstain: none

CM Boemer presented Proposal #3, a 33% increase in spread sheet column labeled "Current Allocation" with a cap of the original budget amount.

Meeting time: 7:40p.m.

Point of Order: Meeting past scheduled time.

CM Bateman made motion to extend meeting time to 8:00p.m. CM Malone seconded.

CM Flores states that he can't stay. CM Witt comments that he will have to check, that he may not be able to stay.

Public Comment: none

Vote: A roll call vote was taken.

Ayes: CM Bateman, CM Berry, CM Boemer, CM Flores, CM Graham, CM Malone, CM Witt.

Noes: none

Abstain: none

VIII. Next Step – New Business

1.) CM Graham motioned to request from the County \$269,922 or \$270K to restore the level of care. CM Bateman seconded.

Public Comment: none

Vote: A roll call vote was taken.

Ayes: CM Bateman, CM Berry, CM Boemer, CM Graham, CM Witt.

Noes: CM Flores

Recuse: CM Malone

2.) CM Witt motioned to request that the County provide \$147,075. CM Berry seconded.

Public Comment: none

Vote: A roll call vote was taken.

Ayes: CM Bateman, CM Berry, CM Boemer, CM Flores, CM Graham, CM Witt.

Noes: none

Recuse: CM Malone

Meeting time: 8:02p.m.

Point of Order: Meeting past scheduled time.

CM Malone made motion to extend meeting time to 8:15p.m. CM Bateman seconded.

Public Comment: none

Vote:

Ayes: CM Bateman, CM Berry, CM Boemer, CM Flores, CM Graham, CM Malone, CM Witt.

Noes: none

Abstain: none

3.) CM Flores motioned to request the amount of \$300K from the County. CM Witt seconded.

Public Comment: none

Vote: A roll call vote was taken.

Ayes: CM Berry, CM Boemer, CM Flores, CM Graham. (66% of voting – motion passes)

Noes: CM Bateman, CM Witt

Recuse: CM Malone

4.) CM Boemer motioned to request from the County \$208, 500. The category amounts would be completed by the Co-Chairs using averaging. CM Berry seconded.

Public Comment: none

Vote: A roll call vote was taken.

Ayes: CM Bateman, CM Berry, CM Boemer, CM Flores, CM Graham, CM Witt.

Noes: none

Recuse: CM Malone

5.) CM Graham motioned to request from the County \$100K. The category amounts would b completed by the Co-Chairs using averaging. CM Witt seconded.

Public Comment: none

Vote: A roll call vote was taken.

Ayes: CM Bateman, CM Berry, CM Boemer, CM Flores, CM Witt.

Noes: CM Graham

Recuse: CM Malone

6.) Co-Chairs to prepare an overview, including “key points” to present with the “scenarios” to Larry Meredith at June 13, 2007 Care Council Meeting.

IX. Meeting Adjourned at 8:13p.m.