



DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH AND HUMAN SERVICES

Larry Meredith, Ph.D., Director

DIVISION OF PUBLIC HEALTH
COMMUNITY HEALTH &
PREVENTION SERVICES

899 NORTHGATE DRIVE, SUITE 415
SAN RAFAEL, CA 94903
PHONE: (415) 473-4340
FAX: (415) 473-6266

Marin HIV/AIDS Care Council Meeting
MINUTES
(Approved 7/22/09)
Wednesday, June 10, 2009
4:30p.m. - 6:30p.m.
3240 Kerner Blvd. – Room 109
San Rafael, CA 94903

Council Members Present: Will Boemer, Kevin Cronin, Wade Flores, James Frazier, Peter Hansen, Walter Kelley, Jennifer Malone, Scott Marcum, Craig Richard, Norge Santana, David Witt.

Council Members Absent: Roy Bateman, Jeff Byers.

Staff Present: Cicily Emerson, Chris Santini, Michael Schieble, Jenny Stephens.

Public : Jon Botson, Elaine Flores.

I. Call to Order.

Meeting called to order at 4:35p.m. by Co-Chair Kelley.

II. Roll Call.

Roll was called by Council Support and quorum was established with 9 of 13 Members present. CM Bateman was absent and excused. CM Byers was absent and excused. CM Malone and CM Witt arrived after the roll call increasing the final attendance to 11 of 13 Members present.

III. Review and Approval of Agenda – VOTE

The agenda was reviewed. Council Support requested that item, “IV. Review and approval of April 8, 2009, May 13, 2009, and May 27, 2009 Minutes”, be edited to read, “IV. Review and approval of April 8, 2009, Minutes”.

CM Boemer motioned to approve the agenda with edits. CM Richard seconded.

A voice **vote** was conducted. All were in Favor. None were Opposed.

The edited agenda was approved unanimously.

IV. Review and Approval of Minutes – VOTE

4:43p.m. CM Malone arrives.

CM Marcum made motion to approve the April 8, 2009, minutes. CM Frazier seconded.

A voice **vote** was conducted. Ayes were heard. None were Opposed. The April 8, 2009, minutes were approved.

V. General Announcements.

CM Boemer announced that today [June 10, 2009] there was an afternoon rally in Sacramento. The rally was in opposition to the proposed funding cuts to the State of AIDS.

CM Boemer reported that a Marin Contingent met in Sonoma County with members of Project Reconnect.

Co-Chair Flores announced that the San Francisco HIV Health Services Planning Council will meet Monday, June 22, 2009, from 4:30p.m. to 7:30p.m. at 6th and Mission [1010 Mission Street – Bayanihan Community Center – Barangay Hall]. The San Francisco Council meets the 4th Monday of the month.

CM Frazier announced that June is Gay Pride Month. On Sunday, June 28, 2009, CM Frazier, “...will have the pleasure of being on the cable car [in the San Francisco Gay Pride Parade] for the San Francisco AIDS Foundation.”

CM Malone announced that the San Francisco AIDS Walk is July 19, 2009. A bus will be available from M.A.P. furnishing transportation to and from the AIDS Walk. Contact Andy Fyne at M.A.P.

CM Marcum announced that the Healing Waters [www.hwaters.org] winter water rafting trip is June 13 & 14, 2009.

Public Comment: None

VI. Public Comment – None

VII. Co-Chair s Report.

Co-Chair Kelley requested an update from C. Santini on the “HIV Awareness for African Americans” meeting. C. Santini reported that the Haas Foundation is looking to fund HIV awareness initiatives in the Black population of men who have sex with men. The meeting was an advisory group from all over the Bay Area to develop feasibility. The group produced good ideas including; stigma, homophobia, outreach to leadership in the Black community, and getting churches involved. The meeting did not produce a consensus on possible programs or a funding request for the Haas Foundation.

Co-Chair Flores 1.) Co-Chair Flores reported that he spoke to CM Cronin about the proposed budget cuts to the State Office of AIDS. Co-Chair Flores requested that a letter be drafted by CM Cronin on the impact to Marin and “...the hardships that we will go through if we get the budget cuts.” The letter would be sent to government representatives from the Members of Marin. CM Cronin commented that he did not really know the possible impact since there are a number of different budget scenarios. CM Cronin described the idea of “community viral load”. If medication funding was decreased and HIV+ individuals go off their medications the level of HIV “infectiousness in the community increases” and “...there is a significant risk of increased new HIV exposure.” Co-Chair Flores reiterated the need “to come up with something” about Marin from the Members of the Council.

2.) Co-Chair Flores introduced the prioritization and allocation process and reviewed the handout (see *attachment #1*), “What are the Priority Setting and Allocation Processes?” The handout included, “Guidelines for Council Members”. Co-Chair Flores emphasized the need for Council Members, “...to look at the whole, [the] big picture through the process.” The guidelines for Council Member conflict of interest and the rules of respectful engagement were briefly referenced.

Public Comment: None

VIII. Presentation on Ryan White Funding Process by Bill Blum.

Co-Chair Flores introduced and welcomed Bill Blum the Interim Director of HIV Health Services from the San Francisco Department of Public Health.

Mr. Blum started his presentation by stating his understanding of the goal of the agenda topic. “So my understanding ... of what you were hoping to hear from me today ... was to understand the funding process from the Federal Level to the local level, with special interest on Part B”.

Mr. Blum noted that the United States has twenty-two Eligible Metropolitan Areas / EMA. An EMA is defined as a specific geographic area, with a minimum population of 50,000 and a minimum population of 2,000 with AIDS. An EMA can be one or multiple counties, “... but the import thing is how the body [counties] function as one.” Marin and San Mateo County are included in the three county San Francisco EMA.

The 1990 Ryan White Treatment Act includes a community planning process for the prioritization and allocation of funds. Once called Title I and Title II funds, the Ryan White Treatment Modernization Act now refers to funds as Part A and Part B. Currently, there are five Ryan White funding parts; Part A, B, C, D and F. Part A funding is available to EMA’s and Transitional Grant Areas / TGA’s and the formula is based on the number of individuals in the EMA with AIDS. The San Francisco EMA uses the same process to divide the funding by county. Part B funding is based on “demonstrated need and other criteria”. The application process is “competitive”, a scoring system is used and the funding award is based on an EMA’s score. Mr. Blum used the Fiscal Year 2008 for an example. The specific dollars from the 2008 Federal appropriation, the Part A and Part B award to the San Francisco EMA, and the resulting funding dollars to individual counties were detailed.

The reporting of AIDS cases by the State of California was discussed. There were a number of questions by Council Members on 'names based reporting' and the State data and AIDS cases calculation. Mr. Blum commented that funding considers AIDS cases, does not consider an individual's income, and the number of HIV+ individuals is generally not considered by the formula.

Mr. Blum noted that Part B dollars go directly to the states and are used mostly for AIDS medications, in California the AIDS Drug Assistance Program / ADAP. The State "shares" the Part B funding with the Counties to fund a number of services. The State provides the general direction for the use of the dollars with no direct community based input. The process used by the San Francisco EMA to divide the Part B award between the Counties was described.

Note: 5:13pm. Dr. Witt arrives.

Mr. Blum suggested for additional information the website, <http://hab.hrsa.gov/aboutus.htm#B> "The HIV/AIDS Program: Ryan White Parts A-F". Co-Chair Flores thanked Mr. Blum.

Public Comment: None

5:18p.m. recess.

5:22p.m. meeting resumes.

IX. Conflict of Interest Disclosure.

Council Members were requested to complete, sign, and date the handout, "Marin HIV/AIDS Care Council Conflict of Interest Disclosure Form."

Co-Chair Flores commented while giving instructions to new Members, "... most of you are unaffiliated... unless you are connected some how to one of the agency that are listed." CM Richard stated, "People who are unaffiliated [and] receive services and who sit on the Council have a perceived conflict of interest..." Co-Chair Flores responded, "... we'll waive that unless it's actually [an actual], it's waived."

Council Support received the Conflict of Interest forms at the end of the meeting. Scott Marcum, Norge Santana, and Dr. Davis Witt have current forms on file. Conflict of Interest forms are needed from Roy Bateman and Jeff Byers.

Public Comment: None

X. Prioritization and Allocation Process for Fiscal Year 2010 -'11.

Co-Chair Flores asked J. Stephens to review the information in the packet received by Council Members for prioritization and allocation. The handout, "Marin County HIV/AIDS Care Council Title I Allocation Process FY [Fiscal Year] 2010-2011" was reviewed. The attachments included; "2010-11 Service Priority Review", "HRSA Service Categories", "Epidemiological Data", "Service Category Summary Sheets", and "Decision Matrix". Council Members were asked to complete the allocation worksheet (page 2) in the "Decision Matrix" handout and bring it to July Allocation meeting.

M. Schieble referenced the handout, "Fiscal Year Time Line" and recapped for the Council Members who did not attend the June 2, 2009, training the budget references of "this year", "last year", and "next year". The service categories to be prioritized were projected on the a/v screen. The worksheet included individual Council Member's service category ranking that had been received by Council Support in advance of the meeting. It was reiterated that the prioritization of service categories is a simple ranking and the core services / support services or 75% / 25% constraint does not apply when considering prioritization.

An additional date for Allocation training has been tentatively scheduled for June 23, 2009, from 1:00p.m. to 3:00p.m. at the 899 Northgate Drive - County Office.

Public Comment: None

XI. Service Category Prioritization for Fiscal Year 2001-'11 - VOTE.

Council Members were asked to review and comment on their ranking. Co-Chair Flores start the discussion and gave reasons and personal examples for his prioritization by service category.

CM Witt commented that there are two ways to look at it [prioritization] ...one is how vital is the service and the other is how well supported is an alternative....somewhere between them you get the ranking. Vital services should be ranked high, but if a non-vital service is unsupported it should be ranked higher. Transportation, Food Bank, and Emergency Financial Assistance should be moved up [ranked higher] over residential substance abuse. If you look at distributing funds over a large group of people, residential substance abuse takes away, one unit of treatment, takes away pretty much all the transportation and food. It may be an important intervention for one person, but the ethical concept of 'the common good' should outweigh it. Higher up [top ranked categories], they are all pretty close...".

CM Malone referenced the service category summary sheets and commented on ranking, "...that in addition to what kinds of funds support and do support any particular service...it's also important to look at how many people utilize a service". CM Malone enumerated the Clients that used each service category from the 2008-'09 Service Category Summary Sheets. CM Malone offered a prioritization ranking by service category and it was entered into the worksheet.

Additional comments noted were; CM Cronin suggested, "... that additional rank should be given to Food and Emergency Financial Assistance." CM Richard suggested an increased ranking to Oral Health Care, noting that Denti-Cal is going to be cut. CM Frazier expressed concern that "...extra food cards can only be used to buy food." The discussion that followed reasoned that a Client could use a Safeway card to buy any of their household stuff or "free up" money from their household food budget for other expenses.

A motion was made for a specific rank of a service category. The motion was discussed and withdrawn. A second motion was made for a specific rank of a service category. The motion was withdrawn.

6:23p.m. Point of Order.

CM Witt made motion to extend the meeting time to 6:45p.m. CM Malone seconded. A voice **Vote** was conducted. All were in favor. None were opposed. The meeting time was extended to 6:45p.m.

A work group style discussion followed, which produced agreement as rankings were considered.

CM Witt made motion to approve the following ranking as the 2010 -'11 Service Category Prioritization. CM Marcum seconded.

Service Category		2010-'11 Rank
a.	Outpatient /Ambulatory health services	1
j.	Mental health services	2
n.	Case Management (non-Medical)	3
l.	Medical Case Management (including Treatment Adherence)	4
r.	Food bank/home-delivered meals	5
w.	Transportation Medical Services	6
q.	Emergency financial assistance	7
d.	Oral health care	8
c.	AIDS Pharmaceutical Assistance (local)	9
g.	Home health care (nursing)	10
h.	Home and Community-based Health Services (attendant care)	10
m.	Substance abuse services–outpatient	11
ad.	Residential substance abuse treatment	12

Co-Chair Flores asked for Public Comment.

Public Comment: C. Santini commented that two Clients are currently receiving methadone treatment in Marin. [in reference to the substance abuse service category].

Vote:

Ayes: CM Boemer, CM Flores, CM Frazier, CM Hansen, CM Kelley, CM Marcum, CM Richard, CM Santana, CM Witt.

Noes:

Recuse: CM Cronin, CM Malone.

Abstain: None

The above ranking as the 2010 –'11 Service Category Prioritization was approved. 9-0-2-0.

Public Comment: None

XII. Membership Committee Report

The Membership Committee met on June 2, 2009. The application of Elaine Flores was considered and an invitation to interview will be made. The Membership meeting was followed by allocation and prioritization training.

Public Comment: None

XIII. Community Outreach and Advocacy Committee Report.

The COAC is scheduled to meet June 25, 2009 at 5:30p.m.

Public Comment: None

XIV. Division of Public Health Report

None

XV. Next Step – New Business

- Next Meeting July 8, 2009, 3:30p.m.-6:30p.m. – location to be announced.
- Additional Allocation meeting *if needed*, July 22, 2009, 4:30p.m. -6:30p.m.
- CM Cronin – draft a Letter of Impact to Marin based on proposed budget cuts to State Office of AIDS.
- Roy Bateman –complete Conflict of Interest Disclosure.
- Jeff Byers - complete Conflict of Interest Disclosure.

XVI. Meeting Adjourned at 6:48p.m.