



**Marin HIV/AIDS Care Council Meeting
MINUTES**

Wednesday, July 11, 2012

4:00p.m. - 7:00p.m.

3240 Kerner Blvd.

San Rafael, CA 94901

Connection Center – Room 109

[Approved September 12, 2012]

Larry Meredith, Ph.D.
DIRECTOR

Margaret Kisliuk
DIVISION DIRECTOR

HIV/AIDS Services

Community Health &
Prevention Services
899 Northgate Drive
Suite 415
San Rafael, CA 94903
415 473 7590 T
415 473 6266 F
475 473 3232 TTY
www.marincounty.org/hs

Council Members Present: Roy Bateman, Kevin Cronin, Elaine J. Flores, Wade Flores, James Frazier, Walter Kelley, Jennifer Malone, Scott Marcum.

Council Members Absent: Trinity Dushon(LOA).

Staff Present: Cicly Emerson, Chris Santini, Michael Schieble, Sparkie Spaeth.

Public: Julie Dowling, Jami Ellermann, Deborah Kasel, Susan Walters.

I. Call to Order.

The meeting was called to order at 4:14p.m. by Co-Chair Cronin.

II. Roll Call.

Roll was called at 4:14p.m. and quorum was established with 5 of 8 Members present.

CM Dushon (LOA) is on a leave of absence.

CM E.J. Flores and CM W. Flores arrived after the roll call at 4:18p.m. and increased the attendance to 7 of 8 Members present.

CM Bateman was late due to a work conflict and arrived at 4:53p.m. Attendance was increased to all 8 Members present.

III. Review and Approval of Agenda - VOTE

CM Frazier motioned to approve the agenda. CM Kelley seconded.

A voice **vote** was conducted. All were in favor. No objections were heard.

The agenda was approved.

IV. Review and Approval of June 13, 2012 Minutes – VOTE

CM Kelley made motion to approve the June 13, 2012 minutes. CM Malone seconded.

The minutes were reviewed. Co-Chair Cronin asked for objections. No objections were heard.

The minutes from the June 13, 2012 Marin Care Council meeting were approved.

V. General Announcements

CM Malone announced that the San Francisco AIDS Walk is July 15, 2012, and “support is appreciated”. The M.A.P. Team will be car pooling to the event.

CM Marcum announced that the Marin AIDS Project and Healing Waters annual white water rafting trip is August 17, 18, and 19, 2012. Contact Andy Fyne for registration and scholarship information.

VI. Co-Chair Report

Co-Chair Cronin reviewed the “Rules of Respectful Engagement for the Planning Council”, *Marin HIV/AIDS Care Council - New Member Orientation Handbook & Resource Guide* - page 18 & 19. The “Meeting Ground Rules” were also reviewed –page 17. Co-Chair Cronin added that the Allocation process would consider only one motion at a time, each Service Category would be reviewed, and prior to each vote there would be time available for public comment.

Co-Chair Marcum read the process for Public Comment, "Order of Business Format – IV. Public Comment", page 17.

CM W. Flores asked if the Priority Ranking approved at the June 2012 meeting was available. Council Support responded that the 2013-'14 Prioritization Worksheet is available in the June 13, 2012 Minutes (page 6) and the rankings also appear in column "A", "New Priority Rank" on the 2013/14 Decision Matrix spreadsheet.

VII. Public Comment
None

VIII. Division of Public Health Report

After clarification about the agenda from Co-Chair Cronin, C. Emerson stated that there were a few announcements and C. Santini would present the County proposal for the 2013-'14 Allocation.

C. Emerson reported: 1.) The Marin County 2013-'14 Allocation information will be presented to the San Francisco HIV Health Services Planning Council for approval at the Allocation and Prioritization Summit on August 24, 2012. Marin Care Council Members are encouraged to attend the full day Summit. Last year the Marin Allocation was approved at the San Francisco Council's August meeting. 2.) C. Santini will attend the July 30, 2012 San Francisco Council meeting, since C. Emerson is not available to attend. 3.) In the recently approved California State budget, ADAP co-pays had been considered but were eliminated. 4.) The Ryan White Act is up for reauthorization in 2013 and "we'll be feeding you information as we know it". County Staff will be participating on upcoming HRSA conference calls and will be reporting information to the Care Council. 5.) Marin County is collaborating with the Marin AIDS Project to launch a new HIV prevention and testing program. Sandy Baker and Dawn Beggs are staffing the prevention outreach program. Sandy Baker was introduced and gave a brief overview of the outreach efforts and distributed "Marin - Know Now! Rapid HIV Testing" information cards. C. Santini will represent Marin County and be serving on the EMA wide prevention Council. Going forward, C. Emerson commented that the Public Health Report will include information on prevention efforts, "...so everybody on the care side, knows what's happening".

C. Santini: The "13/14 Decision Matrix for Allocation of Ryan White Funding in Marin County" spreadsheet was distributed and projected. C. Santini reviewed each column heading and a definition was given. The data source and supporting source documents were detailed. The Care Council will be allocating \$635,033 for FY2013-'14. Column "M" – "12/13 Proposed Part B Service Category Award" is actual and approved, since the State budget has been approved. The Part B amount of \$125,307 is a \$799 increase from the 2011/12 Part B award.

CM W. Flores asked about Outpatient Health Services and additional County funds or cost savings carry-over. C. Emerson responded, "...the carry-over is all spent. This is a new budget year".

C. Emerson presented the "County Proposal 2013/14 Ryan White Part A Allocation". A handout was distributed and the proposal was projected. C. Emerson commented, "What we did is reduce the budget on a few different programs and still tried to keep them at operational level. Some things stayed the same. There's no way we could have done it without cutting some programs." Service categories that were reduced were highlighted. A \$10,000 increase to Substance Abuse-Outpatient was noted. The increase is to keep current Clients in services. The proposed budget was developed by looking at current contracts, how money was actually spent, and a "nip and tuck approach".

Discussion followed, regarding current Part B funding and proposed Part A funds. CM Malone asked if the agenda had advanced to the discussion of the Allocation or was the Proposal discussion part of the Department of Public Health report. Co-Chair Cronin suggested that discussion of the County Proposal would be during the Allocation discussion. For Clients without Medi-Cal, co-pays for methadone treatment were stated and discussed (\$212 monthly / totaling \$2,544 yearly).

Public Comment: None

IX. Conflict of Interest Disclosure Statements

Co-Chair Cronin commented that Council Members had already submitted written statements, but for the benefit of the Public, Council Members would state their Conflict of Interest. Council Support confirmed that a "Marin HIV/AIDS Care Council Conflict of Interest Disclosure Form" had been completed and received from

each Council Members.

CM Cronin: Actual conflict of interest – All Service Categories. Affiliated with Marin AIDS Project / Service Provider.

CM E.J. Flores: Unaffiliated

CM W. Flores: Unaffiliated - Consumer

CM Frazier: Unaffiliated

CM Kelley: Unaffiliated - Consumer

CM Malone: Actual conflict of interest - All Service Categories. Executive Director of Marin AIDS Project.

CM Marcum: Unaffiliated - Consumer

Public Comment: None

X. Review of FY2013-'14 Prioritization and Allocation Process

Co-Chair Cronin stated that a proposal had been submitted by the County. C. Santini referenced (page 3) "The Process – Allocation".

CM Kelley made motion to use the "County Proposal" as a base line to start the discussion.

CM Frazier seconded.

A voice vote was conducted.

Public Comment: None

Vote:

Ayes: CM Cronin, CM W. Flores, CM EJ Flores, CM Frazier, CM Kelley, CM Marcum.

Noes: None

Recuse: CM Malone

Abstain: None

As a baseline for discussion, the County proposal was approved. **6-0-1-0**

4:53p.m. CM Bateman arrives.

XI. Service Category Data Review and Discussion

CM W. Flores stated, "I'm sorta Ok with the proposal. There are four categories or five that I would change; that would be Emergency Financial Assistance, Food, Oral Health, the Substance Abuse outpatient thing- Outpatient Services, and probably Medical Case Management."

Co-Chair Cronin asked about the amounts that would be suggested. CM W. Flores continues, "On the Emergency Financial Assistance, the Governor's cuts are still coming. So the assistance programs outside of the Ryan White services are being cut. Like PG&E has already decreased a big percentage and it's going to decrease again. Oral Health in most community forums and talking in San Francisco it's still a priority. I know, I need dental work and I going to get it done real soon [tape inaudible]. I would like to see the food thing go back up to \$60. I'm sure everybody knows that. I think there's more need for Mental Health services than Medical Case Management and from the presentation that Anne Donnelly gave about Case Management Non-Medical, it doesn't seem as urgent as we thought it would be, because we're not in the big transition the other two Counties are. It's there, but it's not as big as we thought [tape inaudible] transitioning. I'm Ok with that proposal, Case Management Non-Medical.

CM Malone asked the Chair, "So procedurally are we going to share our views and then get around to talking about numbers?" CM Malone recommended that the Council consider trends in demand for service, use the number of Clients served (Column "E"), and focus on what is happening in Marin. It was clarified that the total Allocation amount is \$35,000 less compared to 2011-'12.

CM W. Flores stated, "Just for the record, I'm acting as a Marinite, not as a representative of San Francisco or the San Francisco Council. I'm speaking as a member of this Council and as a resident of Marin. Just for the record."

CM Malone commented that Medical Case Management, "...from our experience, in our portion of the delivery of that service, that demand is heavy. We are seeing an increasing number of people who are homeless, have intense needs, and we spend an intense amount of time helping." "Food. Because of the Part B money, the food situation is not bad". "Emergency Financial Assistance... because of the intensity of need that we are

seeing...the need is growing and should be considered.” “In Substance Abuse [Outpatient], I agree that those are important service...the focus should be on paying the co-pays.”

Co-Chair Cronin commented that, initially Anne Donnelly had expressed concern about the transition of LIHP and that had been the initial case in some counties. In Marin, the transition of CMSP has not been the nightmare that was anticipated. The Office of AIDS – HIPP / Health Insurance Premium Payment program has become complicated and important. The focus is on paying insurance premiums, which will result in a savings to ADAP in drug coverage. The changes in these programs have increased the amount of time allocated to benefits counseling / Case Management – Non Medical.

CM Bateman apologized for being late due to a work conflict. “We do have some cutting to do.” What appears to be a flat funding scenario is really a funding decrease of \$35,000 from 2012-’13. Reviewing Core Services, “...all those need to be maintained, at either the lower of 2012-’13 level or the year before”. Reviewing Support Services, “...that meant that that there wasn’t enough money left to support everything in the Support Services categories. I felt it was important to maintain Case Management at the past funding level...I had to cut substantially back on Residential Substance Abuse. I zeroed out Emergency Financial Assistance. I cut the food to just \$10,000. I know these things are not going to be popular, but it seemed like, although those Support Service are important, it didn’t make sense to me to support them at the expense of Core Services that everyone is used to having... I think it’s going to be a tough session to finalize the numbers.”

A discussion followed about the needs of Marin Long Term Survivors versus Clients with severe needs. Data from the “Marin County Ryan White FY 2011/12 Service Category Summary Sheets” was reviewed. The percentages of Clients that are classified as high need, in each of the Service Categories were discussed. CM Bateman summarized the discussion stating, “A large amount of resources go to very few Clients”.

Public Comment:

Deborah Kasel “My name is Deborah Kasel, by the way. I’m a Peer Advocate at M.A.P. A volunteer Peer Advocate and I started a Women’s group called POWER. I had been working with in the community and really kinda’ doing alot of outreach, trying to understand this whole, these homeless issues. I used to be on the Care Council. There was a lot more money and a lot more agencies vying for the money and now it’s so interesting cuz it’s so little little of money and so very important now. It’s more important than ever where you put the money.”

“Two fold, one was just clarity where did you come up with these priority rankings. How did you make that? I was just wondering if I could get some clarity on that. For the most part I agree with a lot of what Wade said, just because I’ve been in the circle of actual consumers and I’m a consumer myself. I know exactly, I’m kinda’ like on my war zone and I know exactly what it’s like and it’s real talking with people. There seems to be not enough communication, where people come in to get services, they seem confused. They don’t know what all the services they could be getting, they may hit two or three people in a given agency when they didn’t really need to. So communication is like something that is really vital. I’m putting that out up front. A lot of the people I talk to didn’t know that there was food cards or there was mental health or there’s, they didn’t even know about these services, so it’s hard to, you know, find out what people really need, if a lot of people aren’t using the services and the ones that are, you know, do you know how many homeless people we have in Marin County? Back in the day that was something that we, that wouldn’t allow homeless people to be one the street and we would take them in and figure it out and there shouldn’t be homeless people HIV+ on the street right now in my opinion. It’s ridiculous. Do we know the number?”

“As far as long term survivors, there’s two different long term survivors; as far as ones that are trying, I’m trying to get back to work. Trying to get healthy again, so I can get out of this \$950 dollars a month, it’s ridiculous to live on it’s a reality check for everybody here. Think about that. How do you spread out? How do you make ends meet? How do you have any mental health on \$950 dollars a month? Also, the HIV virus in itself causes depression. Not only that, but the drugs, some of the drugs cause depression, so the mental health you might have to look at. There are people that have, you know they were born with disabilities and mental health [issues]. There is this other issue were people are given this disease. We didn’t ask them to be depressed. We are being pushed down by these drugs and the HIV virus itself. It’s out of our control. It’s not something that should be cut and if there are other resources that would be great too.”

“As far as emergency funding, again I don’t think that should be cut. It should be increased. I agree with the food card situation, that last report that you had on food cards, it said that, I guess I was reading it right, some people

get 2 cards or 3 cards, as far as I know everybody's getting one card. I don't know what the criteria is and how that's figured out. I don't think anybody does."

Co-Chair Marcum and C. Santini clarify food card report and give an explanation.

D. Kasel continues, "So again it's just getting that clarity out to people, I think that is really important. And lastly, the last forum that you did I thought was wonderful. Where you're actually talking about specific subjects, you know. Doing pros and cons and actually getting input from the people. That's it. Good luck with your meeting."

5:34p.m. Dinner Break

6:01p.m. Meeting resumes

XII. FY2013-'14 Service Category Allocation

CM Malone's proposed Allocation was entered into the spreadsheet during the break by Council Support. The spreadsheet was projected and CM Malone gave an overview of the proposed amounts.

CM W. Flores developed a proposed Allocation and the amounts were entered into the spreadsheet and projected. The total did not balance and meeting time was used for recalculation. CM W. Flores proposed that the monthly amount of food cards be increased from \$40 to \$60 per month per Client. A lengthy discussion followed about the funding amount needed to support the increase.

CM Kelley suggested that the Council vote to approve one of the proposed Allocations and in the future reevaluate and shift unspent funds. C. Emerson commented, "Money's getting tighter" and that reallocation would be unlikely".

CM Kelley made motion to adopt the proposal made by CM Malone [Column "S"]. CM Frazier seconded. CM EJ Flores commented on both proposal and announced, "I'm leaning toward Wade's, column "T"."

The discussion returned to increasing the monthly Food Card benefit from \$40 to \$60. Client eligibility, the M.A.P. food pantry program, and a prior two-tiered food program supporting severe need Clients was discussed. At the request of Council Support, it was clarified and confirmed that current Food Service Category funds are only spent to purchase food cards and no other food program.

CM Malone stated, "This is an administrative kind of decision, which would be outside of the scope of the Council, but just to take note of the fact that it is an available possibility. You could decide to limit to spend this to the lowest income people. So if you reduce the income eligibility for example for Food, you have a lot of people who would be very unhappy with this, but if you limited it like to people with \$950 or less, you could probably give them \$60 in [food] cards and if you set a lower limit on Emergency [Financial Assistance], same thing, you could give a greater benefit to fewer people. I think that's a consideration that could keep you inside the unfortunate limits of this budget, but give the greatest benefit to those with the greatest need. Right now we are allowing people with up to \$1,800 a month to have Emergency Funds, not as much as the lower income people. You could push it lower. It's a concept. It is something to keep in mind if you wanted to get a higher level of benefit."

C. Santini reiterated that more than \$10,000 was needed to increase the current food card benefit to \$60 per person. An additional \$35,000 would be required.

CM E.J. Flores stated, "If we wanted to do something that Wade had said, with that money, like we're going back to what we used to do. Severe need, they get \$60, the ones that are healthy, they get \$40. Income [based] severe need. That's what we've been trying to do."

Co-Chair Cronin commented that we consider in the future, CM Malone's suggestion about income guidelines.

CM W. Flores stated, "You said that last time and I got shafted. Not only I, but so did the community. I'm not going to go that [way]. I can hear the argument. Yes, there are pantries all over the place but we're HIV. We have special diet needs and those places do not cater to our needs. We have this argument over and over and over and over and over. On the Emergency Financial, I've gone three years of never accessing that program. Nobody's ever called me and say, oh Wade you still have \$350 you can blow. Nobody's ever told me that, so is that money really being spent wisely. It all comes down to how well the money is being spent. If it is going to

people that are really eligible and below income, then fine. I can handle that. We're asking the public to work with you guys, so you have to give and take. Somewhere along we're going to have to break it. Like I said, to keep people happy because of the first step it might make everything a little easier up the ladder. That's all".

Co-Chair Marcum reread the motion prior to the vote.

The motion made by CM Kelley, was to approve Column "S", titled "13/14 Final Care Council Service Category Award". CM Frazier had seconded the motion.

Public Comment: None

13/14 Decision Matrix for Allocation of Ryan White Funding in Marin County

SERVICE CATEGORY	
Core Services	13/14 Final Care Council Service Category Award
Outpatient /Ambulatory health services	\$150,000
Mental health services	\$92,000
Medical case management	\$150,000
Home and community-based health services (Nurse case management)	\$43,000
Home and community-based health services (attendant care)	\$2,500
Substance abuse treatment services–outpatient	\$6,000
Oral health care	\$20,000
AIDS pharmaceutical assistance (local)	\$9,000
Support Services	
Case management (non-medical)	\$108,000
Residential substance abuse treatment	\$2,000
Emergency financial assistance	\$28,500
Food (vouchers)	\$10,000
Medical transportation services	\$9,000
TOTALS	\$630,000
Council support	\$5,033
Core Services	\$472,500
Support Services	\$157,500
TOTALS	\$635,033

A randomized roll call vote was conducted.

Vote:

Ayes: CM Bateman, CM Frazier, CM Kelley, CM Marcum.

Noes: CM EJ Flores, CM W. Flores.

Recuse: CM Cronin, CM Malone.

Abstain: None

The 2013-'14 Service Category Allocation was approved. **4-2-2-0 / 66.6%**

XIII. Next Steps - New Business

August 2012 Meeting

The Council was asked if they planned to meet in August 2012. Council Support reported that in August 2011 the Council met and in August 2010 the Care Council did not meet. It was the consensus not to meet in August 2012. Instead, Council Members were encouraged to attend the San Francisco Summit.

Next Meeting: September 12, 2012 – Room 110 Connection Center, 4:30p.m. – 6:30p.m.

CM W. Flores announced that he was not available to attend the September Care Council meeting.

Next Step / To Do's

- Agenda Item – Review and discuss Food Card income eligibility levels.
- Agenda Item – Presentation Marin County Mental Health programs and services.
- Agenda Item – Presentation Marin County Substance Abuse programs and services.
- CE – Report on client eligibility recertification mandate (ADAP) and compliance monitoring.
- WF – Develop Membership Recruitment poster.
- MJS – E-mail Subsequent Term form (Sept. agenda) to RB, WF, & JM.

XIV. Meeting Adjourned at 7:05 p.m.