



DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH AND HUMAN SERVICES

Larry Meredith, Ph.D., Director

DIVISION OF PUBLIC HEALTH
**COMMUNITY HEALTH &
PREVENTION SERVICES**

899 NORTHGATE DRIVE, SUITE 415
SAN RAFAEL, CA 94903
PHONE: (415) 473-7590
FAX: (415) 473-6266

Marin HIV/AIDS Care Council Meeting MINUTES

Wednesday, July 20, 2011

4:30p.m. - 7:00p.m.

3420 Kerner Blvd.

San Rafael, CA 94903

Connection Center – Room 110

[Approved September 14, 2011]

Council Members Present: Roy Bateman, Kevin Cronin, Elaine J. Flores, Wade Flores, James Frazier, Walter Kelley, Jennifer Malone, Scott Marcum, David Witt.

Council Members Absent: None.

Staff Present: Cicily Emerson, Chris Santini, Michael Schieble, Sparkie Spaeth.

Public: Cher Evans, Deborah Kasel.

I. Call to Order.

The meeting was called to Order at 4:38p.m. by Co-Chair Kelley.

II. Roll Call.

Roll was called and quorum was established with 6 of 9 Members present.

CM Bateman, CM Malone, and CM Witt arrived after the roll call increasing the attendance to 9 of 9 Members present.

III. Review and Approval of Agenda – VOTE

The agenda was reviewed. CM Frazier motioned to approve the agenda. CM EJ Flores seconded.

A voice **vote** was conducted. Co-Chair Cronin asked for objections. No objections were heard.

The agenda was approved.

IV. Review and Approval of June 8, 2011 Minutes – VOTE

CM EJ Flores requested that “XI. Conflict of Interest Disclosure Presentation and Council Members Statements” read “CM E.J. Flores: Unaffiliated/ Unaligned”.

CM Marcum made a motion to approve the June 8, 2011 minutes. CM W. Flores seconded.

4:40p.m. CM Bateman arrives.

4:40p.m. CM Witt arrives.

4:42p.m. CM Malone arrives.

A voice **vote** was conducted. Co-Chair Cronin asked for objections. No objections were heard.

The June 8, 2011 Marin Care Council minutes were approved with one correction.

V. General Announcements

CM Marcum announced that M.A.P. and Healing Waters will host the annual white water rafting trip July 29-31, 2011. Registration is available at M.A.P.

Co-Chair Kelley announced “Blackout 2011”, August 5-7, 2011. The Oakland Black and Brown LGBTQ weekend pride event 2011 theme is “Let Go and Celebrate Us!”. [www.oaklandblackout.com]

CM W. Flores announced that the San Francisco HIV Health Services Planning Council – 2011 Prioritization and Allocation Summit is August 26, 2011. A vote to approve the Marin Allocation will be scheduled on the agenda. Marin Council Members were encouraged to attend.

Co-Chair Kelley announced Oakland Pride, September 4, 2011. [www.oaklandpride.org]

CM W. Flores reported that the San Francisco Listening Group met on July 13, 2011. CM W. Flores offered to present the information to the Care Council when the report is completed.

VI. Public Comment

Public Comment: None

VII. Co-Chair Report

CM Bateman submitted on July 12, 2011, "Marin HIV/AIDS Care Council Conflict of Interest Disclosure Form": Actual conflict of interest – All Service Categories / employed by Marin County.

Council Support has completed the 2011 update of Conflict of Interest Disclosure for all Council Members.

Public Comment: None

VIII. Division of Public Health Report

C. Emerson announced that Marin County will present information on County HIV/AIDS epidemiology data, services and the 2012-'13 Allocation at the July 25, 2011, meeting of the San Francisco HIV Health Services Planning Council. The "combined presentation" will include a report titled, "Overview of HIV/AIDS in Marin County" [see Attachment A] and the 2012-'13 Allocation budget.

Public Comment: None

IX. Review of Rules of Respectful Engagement

Copies of the "Rules of Respectful Engagement for the Planning Council" [*Marin HIV/AIDS Care Council - New Member Orientation Handbook & Resource Guide* (page 18 & 19)] were distributed and reviewed.

Co-Chair Cronin stated, "I just wanted to remind everybody, one of our most important functions here is that we allow our [and] encourage our clients to come and participate. When we engage with each other, we will be respectful and when we listen to each other, we will let each other complete our sentences, and that we will not get emotional [or] too caught up."

CM W. Flores asked, "Are we going to enforce the fact that we are not to address the public or ask them questions?"

A discussion on public comment followed. Council Members commented on the past process. CM Malone – Council discussion is completed before public comment. CM Bateman – Allow for public comment, not get caught up in back and forth, and to use discretion. CM Witt – direct questions and comments to the Chair. CM Frazier reiterated the need for all questions to be directed to the Chair.

Because the focus of the meeting was the allocation, it was agreed that a future agenda item would be to review and discuss the procedure of facilitating Public Comment. Co-Chair Cronin thanked CM W. Flores for the clarification.

Public Comment: None

X. Finalize 2011-'12 Budget - VOTE

The handout titled, "*12/13 Decision Matrix for Allocation of Ryan White Funding in Marin County*" was distributed and reviewed. Column "L", "M", and "N" contained information about the proposed 2011-'12 Ryan White budget.

C. Emerson reported that the latest information received from San Francisco about the 2011-'12 Part A award is "...around a 4.4% cut". The Minority AIDS Initiative/MAI funds needed to be considered in the calculation, therefore "...maybe at a 5% reduction". The calculation also considers that AIDS cases are "down" in San Francisco and Marin and "up" in San Mateo County. The award amount of **\$775,703** was proposed based on a 5% funding reduction scenario. C. Santini suggested reviewing and applying the percents to the final award.

A general discussion followed about the information presented in the "Decision Matrix". The Part-B Award

(column “K” and “M”) were reviewed. C. Emerson commented that Part-B funding is not included in the 75%/25% calculation. The allocation of Part-B funding is decided by the Health Department and does not fall under the purview of the Care Council. The award amounts appear on the spreadsheet so the total budget of a Service Category is represented.

A discussion of “counts” included a detailed review of the data for “Unduplicated Clients Served” (column “C” and “F”). The epidemiology report and HRSA definition of Living AIDS Cases was reviewed. C. Emerson reported that the current number of Marin Living AIDS cases is 376 and last year was 386. San Quentin is not included in the data. CM Malone commented on the public health policy of “test and treat”, which provides services to HIV+ individuals. The “test and treat” population is a larger number than “Living AIDS Cases”. CM Witt remarked that “test and treat” is a San Francisco policy and San Francisco is the only city that has the policy. CM W. Flores added that Ryan White funding was, “...really designed for people in severe need”. The number of 2010-‘11 Unduplicated Clients Served (column “F”) was reviewed in detail at the Service Category level. Benefits counseling, ADAP enrollment and recertification, and the location where a Client receives care was discussed during the analysis of the number of Unduplicated Clients Served for the Medical Case Management and Case Management/non-medical Service Categories. The discussion concluded with C. Emerson stating, “...we think it’s accurate” in reference to the number of Unduplicated Clients from ARIES

CM Witt made a motion to accept column “M” as the prorated [percents] 2011-’12 budget.
 CM Frazier seconded.

2011/12 Allocation Percents of Ryan White Funding in Marin County

SERVICE CATEGORY	2011/12		2011/12	2011/12	
<i>column</i>	M		L	N	A
Core Services	Final % of Total 11/12 Ryan White Award		***Care Council Projected 11/12 Service Category Part-A Award	11/12 Part B Service Category Award	Priority Rank
Medical case management	29.43%		\$224,200		3
Outpatient /Ambulatory health services	20.42%		\$155,563	\$54,528	1
Mental health services	12.22%		\$93,100		2
Home and community-based health services (skilled nursing)	6.20%		\$47,213		10
Oral Health care	3.87%		\$29,450		9
Substance abuse treatment services–outpatient	1.95%		\$14,872		12
Home and community-based health services (attendant care)	1.82%		\$13,876		10
AIDS pharmaceutical assistance (local)	1.56%		\$11,887		8
Support Services					
Case management (non-medical)	13.87%		\$105,638		4
Emergency financial assistance	4.48%		\$34,108		5
Medical transportation services	1.51%		\$11,501		6
Food bank/home-delivered meals (vouchers)	1.37%		\$10,450	\$70,000	7
Residential substance abuse treatment	1.31%		\$9,962		11
Health Education/Risk Reduction	0.00%		\$0		
TOTALS	100.00%		\$761,819	\$124,528	
	77.47%		\$590,161		
	22.53%		\$171,658		

***11/12 based on projected 5% reduction amount of \$775,703

Council support/admin=\$13,884

Council Members commented on the following core Service Categories; Mental Health, Oral Health, and AIDS Pharmaceutical Assistance. Comments were noted for the following support Service Categories; Residential Substance Abuse, Emergency Financial Assistance, Food, and Medical Transportation. Increase/decrease scenarios were suggested by CM Bateman and CM W. Flores.

CM Frazier voiced concern that none of the Service Categories addressed eye care and requested that another Service Category be added. CM W. Flores commented that Ryan White funding does not cover eye care, except for CMV retinitis. In the discussion that followed; co-pays, glasses, and eye care providers (non-Ryan White) were discussed.

6:01p.m. – 6:28p.m. Dinner break.

Following the break, there was discussion about group versus individual care in the Mental Health Service Category. C. Santini read the definition as, “diagnosed mental illness” from the Service Category summary. The discourse led to the location of where Clients receive services and the use of Medical Transportation Service Category funds. There was a lack of agreement about the existence of “EMA-wide” services. Cases of San Francisco based cross county substance abuse services were cited. Co-Chair Cronin requested details, but no specifics were given.

Point of Order - CM Witt requested that the meeting be brought to order, commenting that the group had agreed to no back and forth conversations and that was occurring.

Referrals to the University of the Pacific Dental Clinic and access to the EMA Client Advocate were discussed. C. Emerson commented that Ryan White services are county specific and she is not aware of any cross county or “EMA-wide” services.

Meeting time: 6:50p.m.

CM Malone requested that the Chair “Call the Question” [move the previous question].

The motion was made to end discussion and bring the Council to an immediate vote.

Co-Chair Cronin conducted a voice vote followed by a show of hands.

Ayes: 7

Noes: 2

The motion passed. **7-2-0-0** Public comment was requested by the Chair.

Public Comment: None

Council Support re-read the motion to approve the prorated [percents] 2011-'12 budget.

A randomized roll call vote was conducted.

Vote:

Ayes: CM Bateman, CM Frazier, CM Kelley, CM Marcum, CM Witt.

Noes: CM E.J. Flores, CM W. Flores.

Recuse: CM Cronin, CM Malone.

Abstain: None

The above percents (column “M”) were approved as the 2011-'12 Ryan White – Part A budget. **5-2-2-0**

CM W. Flores commented that the recusals counted as a “no” vote. Council Support clarified that the recusals were not counted in the denominator for a vote. 5 yes / 7 votes. The motion was approved with a 71% majority

XI. 2012-'13 Budget Allocation - VOTE

The 2012-'13 Allocation amount of **\$775,703** was proposed based on a flat funding scenario.

CM Malone asked if there was any information available at this time for the future period. C. Emerson commented that Ryan White reauthorization covered the period. C. Santini commented that the “Stop Loss” funding did not cover the period.

CM Bateman motioned to adopt the Service Category percents (column “P”) for the 2012-'13 Allocation. CM Marcum seconded.

7:00p.m. Point of Order – Meeting overtime

CM Frazier made a motion to extend the meeting time by 10 minutes to 7:15p.m. CM Witt seconded.

There was a consensus to extend the meeting to 7:10p.m.

It was noted that the Service Category percents (column “P”) for the 2012-’13 Allocation were identical to the percents approved for the 2011-’12 budget (column “M”)

Discussion continued. CM Witt commented that there could be substantial cuts in the future, “...we have no idea about the [future] budget.” Co-Chair Cronin added that the impact on funding from Health Care Reform was unknown.

Public Comment: None

A randomized roll call **vote** was conducted.

Vote:

Ayes: CM Bateman, CM E.J. Flores, CM Frazier, CM Kelley, CM Marcum, CM Witt.

Noes: CM W. Flores.

Recuse: CM Cronin, CM Malone.

Abstain: None

The percents (column “P”) were approved as the 2012-’13 Ryan White – Part A budget.

6-1-2-0 (86%majority)

Following the vote, CM W. Flores requested that the Council develop scenario’s based on funding changes.

2012-’13 Allocation of Ryan White Funding in Marin County

SERVICE CATEGORY		2012/13	2012/13
	<i>column</i>	<i>A</i>	
		<i>O</i>	<i>P</i>
	Priority Rank	Care Council 2012-’13 Final Service Category Allocation Part-A Award	% of Total 2012-’13 Ryan White Part-A Award
Core Services			
Medical case management	3	\$224,200	29.43%
Outpatient /Ambulatory health services	1	\$155,563	20.42%
Mental health services	2	\$93,100	12.22%
Home and community-based health services (skilled nursing)	10	\$47,213	6.20%
Oral Health care	9	\$29,450	3.87%
Substance abuse treatment services – outpatient	12	\$14,872	1.95%
Home and community-based health services (attendant care)	10	\$13,876	1.82%
AIDS pharmaceutical assistance (local)	8	\$11,887	1.56%
Support Services			
Case management (non-medical)	4	\$105,638	13.87%
Emergency financial assistance	5	\$34,108	4.48%
Medical transportation services	6	\$11,501	1.51%
Food bank/home-delivered meals(vouchers)	7	\$10,450	1.37%
Residential substance abuse treatment	11	\$9,962	1.31%
Health Education/Risk Reduction		\$0	0.00%
****TOTALS		\$761,819	100.00%
<i>sbtI Core</i>		\$590,161	77.47%
<i>sbtI Support</i>		\$171,658	22.53%

****12/13 based on projected amount of \$775,703

Council support/admin=\$13,884

XII. New Business

Next Meeting: **August 10, 2011** – 5:00p.m.-7:00p.m.

- Agenda Item – (*August*) Co-Chair Nominations.
- Agenda Item – (*August*) Membership – review QII attendance, Application, and flyer locations.
- Agenda Item – (*August*) Community Outreach activities and SF Listening Group report.
- Agenda Item – (September) Report of State budget changes and impact.
- Agenda Item – (September) review 2011-'12 YTD actual and unspent funds.
- CE – E-mail 07/25/11 SF Agenda to CM's.
- CS – Certificate of Appreciation – Completion of Term / EJF.

XIII. Meeting Adjourned at 7:13p.m.