



DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH AND HUMAN SERVICES

Larry Meredith, Ph.D., Director

DIVISION OF PUBLIC HEALTH

COMMUNITY HEALTH & PREVENTION SERVICES

899 NORTHGATE DRIVE, SUITE 415

SAN RAFAEL, CA 94903

PHONE: (415) 473-4276

FAX: (415) 473-6266

Marin HIV/AIDS CARE Council Meeting

Draft MINUTES

October 11, 2006

4:30 – 6:30 PM

899 Northgate, 4th Floor Conference Room

Members Present: Will Boemer, Elyse Graham, Cam Keep, Jennifer Malone, Wade Flores, Roy Bateman

Members Absent: Diva Berry, David Witt, Lisa Becher

Staff Present: Chris Santini, Sparkie Spaeth, Cicily Emerson, Karen Kindig

Others Present: Jeff Byers, Dorothy Kleffner

I. Call to Order

Meeting called to order at 4:40 PM by CM Boemer.

II. Roll Call

CM Berry, CM Witt, and CM Becher were absent.

III. Review and Approval of Agenda

CM Graham suggested that nominations for Membership and Community Outreach & Advocacy Committee Co-Chairs be sent back to each respective subcommittee for vote. CM Boemer suggested that Item IX be moved up to VIII, Item VIII moved down to IX. CM Graham called for approval of the Agenda and vote was done by a show of hands. The Agenda, with noted changes, was approved.

AYES: CM Boemer, CM Graham, CM Keep, CM Malone, CM Flores, CM Bateman

IV. Review and Approval of September 20, 2006 Minutes

CM Bateman noted that Item IX of the 9/20/06 Minutes should read: "*CM Boemer and CM Bateman suggested returning funding to the San Francisco EMA.*" CM Boemer called for approval of 9/20/06 Minutes and vote was done by a show of hands. The Minutes, with noted correction, were approved.

AYES: CM Boemer, CM Graham, CM Keep, CM Malone, CM Flores, CM Bateman

V. General Announcements

- a. CM Malone: 1) The County Dental Clinic will hold a 2-part Dental Clinic for people living with HIV/AIDS, on Thursday, 11/9/06 (Exam and Treatment Plan) and Tuesday, 12/5/06 (Restoration – complete treatments planned at previous appointment). Call 473-5454 to schedule an appointment. 2) MAP is collaborating with County HHS and Kaiser to display parts of the AIDS quilt on World AIDS Day (12/1/06) at 3 high schools and a community venue in Marin. Memorial services will be held at the end of the day at St. Paul's Episcopal Church in San Rafael. Volunteers are needed.
- b. CM Flores: Former San Francisco Mayor Willie Brown is representing the Marin City Community Services District in negotiations with Sutter Health regarding the possibility of operating a medical facility at the Gateway Retail Center in Marin City.
- c. Sparkie Spaeth: Rebecca Smith had her baby on 10/4/06: Opal Rain.

VI. Public Comment

None

VII. Co-Chairs Report

CM Graham welcomed CM Boemer to his new position as Co-Chair and thanked CM Keep for all his hard work as former Co-Chair. CM Boemer thanked both CM Keep and CM Graham for their work as Co-Chairs. CM Graham reminded the Council that all information, including flyers, coming from the Council needs to be approved by the Council prior to it being issued to the public.

Public Comment: None

VIII. Jeff Byers, EMA Liaison from State Office of AIDS

CM Boemer introduced Jeff Byers to the Council. He was invited to present to the Council clarification of the Council's and County's roles and responsibilities regarding prioritization, managing contracts, and service provision.

Jeff Byers stated that he has been with the State Office of AIDS for 14 years and in the CARE Branch, working with Title II, for the past 10 years. Although he is available for clarification, the Council does not report directly to him, but to the Title I Project Officer.

Title I money goes directly from the Federal government to the EMAs. Title II money goes from the Federal government to the State, which sets up different programs using that money. These programs include: ADAP, CARE HIPP (Health Insurance Premium), AIDS Case Management Program, and Title II Consortia (CARE Services Program). Each county (and some groups of counties) used to have separate Title II Consortia, but these were eliminated in Title I areas (EMAs) by the State Office of AIDS in the late 1990s, so as not to be duplicative. The Title I grantees were asked to take on all the Title II dollars for the counties served within their jurisdiction. Marin, San Mateo, and San Francisco Title II dollars were all combined into one contract with the San Francisco EMA. San Francisco keeps all the Title II money, including Marin's and San Mateo's, and gives each county additional Title I money, equivalent to the annual Title II amounts. *[CM Bateman asked: Is there any difference in eligible expenditures for Title I versus Title II?]* There is no difference in allowable use of funds, except that Title II money cannot be used for Council support. (Jeff brought a copy of the "Ryan White CARE Act Title I Manual" and suggested that copies be ordered for each Council member from Jack Newby.)

It is the responsibility of the Council to make needs assessments, set priorities, and make allocations to services. *[CM Malone asked: If Council says it wants to do food vouchers and County says there is the Food Bank, how do we resolve it?]* *[CM Flores asked: How do you make it clear between the two groups – we said this, but you interpreted this way? How do we get a final report to say that they did take what we said and it reflects discussion we did have?]* Certain decisions have been made that were sometimes not voiced clearly to the grantee (County) about Council expectations around service delivery (i.e. "instructions to the grantee"). These specific instructions should be well-documented (e.g. in the Council Minutes). It is within the Council's jurisdiction to specify to the County exactly how services should be provided (e.g. provision of food from food bank vs. food vouchers). *[CM Flores asked: Can we stipulate or make recommendations - what we are actually doing?]* The Council can instruct the County to direct money to specific geographic areas and/or populations. (The Title I Project Officer can be called in if there should be a dispute about instructions from the Council.) The County does have authority to decide which agencies receive contracts, using the RFP process.

It should be remembered that Ryan White funding is "payer of last resort." *[CM Bateman commented: I'm not sure "payer of last resort" and "cost-effectiveness" are the same concept.]* Through needs assessment, the Council should look at what services are already available in the community to low-income consumers and fill in any gaps in care with Ryan White services. Ryan White money shouldn't be used for services that are already provided by others. Services and buying and should be evaluated in a cost-effective and quality way. *[CM Flores asked: We went into the payer of last resort for food vouchers. We used them more to fill in the gap because it started to decrease. Spending same amount of money that wasn't being accessed, putting more money into it, wasn't being utilized, decreasing and decreasing. So, are we using it as a payer of last resort at that point?]* If there is a viable food bank that is accessible and serves the community, it should be used to provide food for consumers. If some people are not accessing the food bank, the Council shouldn't decide to give them food vouchers instead, but should find out why people aren't accessing it and address that. This is not to say, though, that some food vouchering could not be used for certain circumstances, such as for special needs, or emergency situations, or to buy certain items that may not be available at the food bank, such as fresh vegetables.

CM Graham asked about making corrections/revisions to the Minutes when statements needed to be changed. Jeff replied that any corrections are to be made to the original Minutes. If a Council member says that he/she wants to change/revise what he/she had said (as reflected in the Minutes), then those statements should be reflected in the next meeting's Minutes. In other words, in reviewing the Minutes, Council members can ask that the Minutes be corrected to reflect what actually occurred or was stated, but if a Council member has new information or realizes that he/she had misspoken, then those statements should be reflected in the new Minutes.

Public Comment: Dorothy Kleffner sees the Marin HIV/CARE Council as having a different dynamic than the SF Council, since, in Marin, County staff participates in the discussion almost as if they are Council members. On the other hand, she, as a member of the public, is not allowed to participate in the discussion.

Jeff Byers chose to respond to Dorothy's comment: The CARE Act was originally written around the receivers of services, the providers of services, and the public health system that secures those services. Many councils have the local Public Health Officer as the Co-Chair. When there are questions about contracting and delivery of services, feedback from the Public Health Department is integral, since its staff members do the day-to-day work and are the experts. They will often need to jump into the discussion and may appear to have influence, which may not seem fair to a member of the public who does not have the same level of access, but is necessary to speed things along.

IX. Unspent Funds Update

Chris Santini reported:

She looked at data from July and August and created a table showing CARE spending for those two months. There has been under spending in several service categories: Mental Health, Client Advocacy/Benefits Counseling, Case Management, Substance Abuse, Oral Health, Direct Emergency Financial Assistance, Volunteer Services, Food, and Vitamins. (Chris noted that a lot of money most likely will be spent in November and December in the Oral Health category since there will be the Dental Clinics for people living with HIV/AIDS during those two months.) Chris will ask providers at the next Title I Providers meeting to submit September bills. Decisions regarding unspent funds need to be made as soon as possible. This will be on next month's Agenda for a vote. The Council requests an estimated variance for next meeting.

Public Comment: Dorothy Kleffner is excited about what's going on in Primary Care spending and hopes they have a bunch of new clients.

X. Membership Committee Report

CM Flores reported:

- a. The next Membership Committee meeting may not be held until January 2007. A new Committee Assignment Policy may be implemented during that meeting.
- b. He contacted Comcast (channel 26) and Direct TV (channel 22) about being on the public access channels to solicit membership for the Council. He also contacted "We the People" and CARE Council meetings will be listed on their calendar. There will be further discussion about whether or not to purchase an ad in their paper and in the Marin IJ.
- c. He contacted CM Berry and she indicated that she will need to resign from the CARE Council, due to other obligations. He encouraged her to re-apply in the future.
- d. All Council members are encouraged to actively recruit new members for the Council.

CM Graham expressed concern about the Membership Committee not meeting until January 2007, because of the plan for a new Committee Assignment Policy and because new Co-Chairs need to be elected for that subcommittee. She would like there to be a meeting in November. CM Flores said he is waiting to hear back from CM Becher. He said a new day and time for the meeting may need to be chosen. Cicily Emerson said she would poll Membership Committee members to see what day and time is best for everyone.

Public Comment: None

XI. Outreach & Advocacy Committee

CM Boemer reported:

The Community Forum will be held on Wednesday 10/18/06, from 6:30-8:30 PM, at Pickleweed Park Community Center. A 2-sided flyer (English and Spanish) went to the Novato Human Needs Center, Canal Alliance, MAP, the Specialty Clinic, and to the CARE Council public email distribution list. A message was left for "Encuentro Latino," a public access TV and Radio program, about airing a PSA (Public Service Announcement). CM Boemer, Flores, Graham, Witt, and Keep have all agreed to take part in the Forum. They are still trying to locate a translator for the event. An Agenda for the Forum has been created. It was suggested that the flyer also be distributed to: Canal Welcome Center, BiNational event, Marin Treatment Center, Women with HIV support group, and the Title I Providers email distribution list.

Public Comment: None

XII. Discuss Calendar/Council Business for Year

CM Bateman motioned to table discussion of these items until the next meeting. Motion was seconded by CM Malone.

Public Comment: None

A vote was done by show of hands and the motion carried:

AYES: CM Boemer, CM Graham, CM Keep, CM Malone, CM Flores, CM Bateman

XIII. Division of Public Health Report

Sparkie Spaeth and Cicily Emerson reported:

- a. A letter was sent to the San Francisco Dept of Public Health AIDS Office about the Council's recommendation to allocate \$40,000 to the AIDS Emergency Fund, with the stipulation that funds be available to Marin clients, if necessary.
- b. There needs to be a system in place to notify County staff when a subcommittee meeting is cancelled at the last minute.
- c. Agendas for Full Council and subcommittee meetings need to be submitted one week prior to the meeting. The Council's policy/procedures/guidelines for submitting posting agendas will be sent to all Council members.
- d. The Ryan White CARE Act passed in the House, but not in the Senate, which is now in recess. It is assumed that the 2000 guidelines will be followed and nothing changed for the next CARE year because there wouldn't be enough time for HRSA to do what it needs to do.

Public Comment: None

XIV. Next Steps/ Next Agenda Items

- Unspent Funds
- Calendar
- Infrastructure Work Group
- Strategic Planning Retreat
- Cost Caps
- Web Site Development

XV. Meeting Adjourned at 6:35 PM