Marin HIV/AIDS CARE Council Meeting  
*Draft MINUTES*  
November 1, 2006  
4:30 - 6:30 PM  
899 Northgate, 4th Floor Conference Room

**Members Present:** Will Boemer, Diva Berry, Jennifer Malone, Wade Flores, David Witt, Lisa Becher  
**Members Absent:** Roy Bateman, Elyse Graham, Cam Keep  
**Staff Present:** Chris Santini, Sparkie Spaeth, Cicily Emerson, Karen Kindig  
**Others Present:** Peter Hansen; Dean Connorton

I. Call to Order  
Meeting called to order at 4:40 PM by CM Boemer.

II. Roll Call  
CM Bateman, CM Graham, and CM Keep were absent. CM Malone left the meeting at 6:25 PM.

III. Review and Approval of Agenda  
CM Boemer called to approve the Agenda and CM Malone seconded. Vote was done by show of hands. The Agenda was approved.  
**AYES:**CM Boemer, CM Berry, CM Malone, CM Flores, CM Witt, CM Becher

IV. Review and Approval of October 11, 2006 Minutes  
CM Flores requested that Section VIII (Jeff Byers’ presentation) include the specific questions asked by Council members and their names. CM Flores moved to approve the requested amendment, and CM Witt seconded. CM Becher moved to approve 10/11/06 Minutes, with noted amendment, and CM Berry seconded. Vote was done by show of hands. The Minutes were approved.  
**AYES:**CM Boemer, CM Berry, CM Malone, CM Flores, CM Witt, CM Becher

V. General Announcements  
a. **CM Flores:** 1) There are seven appointment slots open at MAIN for acupuncture treatment. 2) The Community Outreach & Advocacy Committee of the SF HIV/AIDS Planning Council is forming an HIV/AIDS Caucus, called PW/AH. Marin consumers are encouraged to participate. 3) The *Consumers’ CARE Report* is now in its second year. More people are encouraged to submit articles. 4) Laura Thomas, from the Tenderloin Consortium, has offered to give a presentation on CARE Act reauthorization to Marin CARE Council. 5) [Poz.com](http://directory.poz.com) has an AIDS Services Directory, directory.poz.com. Wade would like to see more Marin CARE Services listed there.  
b. **CM Malone:** Friday, 12/1, is World AIDS Day. MAP is collaborating with County of Marin HIV Testing Services to display parts of the Names Quilt at Tam High and Marin Catholic. There will be a recognition ceremony at Dominican University and a formal program at St. Paul’s Episcopal in San Rafael at 6 PM.

VI. Public Comment  
Members of the public, Peter Hansen and Dean Connorton, introduced themselves.

VII. Co-Chairs Report  
CM Boemer announced that CM Graham was out ill. He reminded the Council to please be on time to the meetings so that they can start and end on time.

**Public Comment:** None
VIII. Membership Committee Report
CM Becher reported:
1) The next meeting will be Tuesday, 11/7/06, at Hospice of Marin, from 5:30 - 7:30 PM. The agenda will include discussion about implementation of the Membership Plan, review of quarterly attendance of Council members, and work on Section IX of the Orientation Manual. 2) CM Flores will be stepping down as Co-Chair of Membership Committee, since he will be one of the new Co-Chairs of the Community Outreach & Advocacy Committee.

CM Boemer thanked CM Flores for his hard work on the Membership Committee.

IX. Community Outreach & Advocacy Committee Report
CM Boemer reported:
1) The two new Co-Chairs are CM Witt and CM Flores. 2) CM Berry was thanked for her service and helping to start up this committee. 3) The Community Forum was held on 10/18/06 at Pickleweed Park Community Center. There was a small turn out, but good information and feedback was exchanged. [See ATTACHMENT 1: Community Forum Summary.]

Public Comment: None

X. Calendar Year Discussion
After discussion, the items below were assigned to the following Calendar dates:
A. Vote on Unspent Funds – 12/6/06 meeting
B. Discussion about the scope/purpose of the Strategic Planning Retreat – 12/6/06 meeting
C. Review FY 06-07 Allocations and possibly adjust FY 07-08 Allocations – 12/6/06 & 1/3/06 meetings
D. Recommendations on any service categories that the County will need to address through a Request for Proposal (RFP) process for FY 07-08 – 12/6/06 & 1/3/06 meetings
E. Infrastructure Work Group – 1/3/06 meeting
F. Membership orientation made to the full council – 2/7/06 meeting
G. Discussion about complete Annual Calendar for FY 07-08 – 2/7/06 meeting

Public Comment: None

CM Flores moved to accept the proposed Calendar and CM Becher seconded. Vote was done by show of hands. The Calendar was approved.

AYES: CM Boemer, CM Berry, CM Malone, CM Flores, CM Witt, CM Becher

There was a lengthy discussion about Randy Allgaier’s proposal for a Strategic Planning Retreat. CM Flores stated that he is trying to file a grievance against the Council, the County, or the SF HIV/AIDS Planning Council (he’s not sure which one to file against) because the selection of Randy Allgaier as a consultant and his proposal for the retreat were not voted on/approved by the Marin Council. Sparkie Spaeth stated that the Council allocated funds for strategic planning and the County has the authority to decide who the consultant would be. It was decided that Mr. Allgaier would be invited to the next (December) meeting for discussion/clarification about his proposal for the Strategic Planning Retreat. Cicily Emerson asked the Council members to provide her with their written concerns/recommendations for Mr. Allgaier. [See ATTACHMENT 2]

XI. Unspent Funds
Chris Santini reported:
[A 3-month (July-Sept) 06/07 CARE Spending variance table was handed out, per request at last month’s meeting. See ATTACHMENT 3: Revised]
The table is based on contractor invoices through September. The variance shows how much the actual spending is off from where it “should” be at the 3-month point in the 8-month contract period. A positive variance means that there is underspending, or there is more money remaining to be spent than one would expect at the 3-month point. A negative variance means that there is overspending, or there is less money remaining to be spent than one would expect at the 3-month point. The variance is just a guide, because
not all contract spending is in equal monthly increments over the contract period. Also, contractors cannot overspend their contract amounts. For some contracts, such as those with consultants, there have been no invoices submitted yet. Usage of the oral health funds is expected to pick up with the special dental clinics scheduled for November and December. For other services, such as primary medical care, the CARE funds are being spent first because they expire before the County funds available for this service. With this in mind, it still appears that there is underspending in the substance abuse treatment funds and perhaps in direct emergency assistance funds. There was a statement at a previous meeting that the use of the various voucher funds was increasing over time, so the line item for voucher fund payments was broken out for the transportation, substance abuse treatment, oral health, and direct emergency assistance funds and tracked their usage from July-September. The only fund that has experienced increased usage over time is transportation.

Public Comment: None

XII. Division of Public Health Report

*Cicily Emerson and Karen Kindig reported:*

   
   Proposed content for the page includes: Meeting dates/time/location, Purpose/Mission/Values Statement, Agendas (Full Council and Subcommittees), Minutes (Full Council and Subcommittees), List of Members w/affiliations and terms, Calendar, By-Laws, Orientation Manual, Membership Application, and Special Events announcements. The page currently has the Agendas, Minutes, and Membership Application posted on it. This page will be part of the Marin HIV/AIDS CARE Services pages that are currently under construction. The (content) model used for these pages is the Jacksonville, Florida Ryan White Title I Services web site: [http://www.coj.net/Departments/Community+Services/Mental+Health+and+Welfare/Ryan+White/Ryan+White+Services+and+Providers.htm](http://www.coj.net/Departments/Community+Services/Mental+Health+and+Welfare/Ryan+White/Ryan+White+Services+and+Providers.htm)

b. A copy of the *Council Support and Communication with Co-Chairs Policy* was handed out to remind Co-Chairs that the meeting agendas need to be submitted (via email) to Cicily Emerson and Karen Kindig one week prior to the meeting.

Public Comment: None

XIII. Next Steps/ Next Agenda Items

1. Unspent Funds
2. Discuss Scope of Strategic Planning Retreat
3. Review FY06/07 Allocations and Possible Adjustments

XIV. Meeting Adjourned at 6:45 PM
ATTACHMENT 1

Draft – Marin HIV/AIDS CARE Council
Community Forum Summary
10/18/06 – Pickleweed Park Community Center

Attendees: 4 Consumers, 1 spouse + child, 1 County support: Cicily Emerson, 1 Interpreter: Claudia Boaknin, 3 Council Members: Elyse Graham, Wade Flores, Will Boemer, and 1 Consultant: Maria Ramos-Chertok

Prioritization Exercise results:

Oral Health: 8 dots
Direct Emergency Financial Assistance: 6 dots
Food: 5 dots
Primary Medical Care: 5 dots
Transportation: 4 dots
Mental Health Care: 3 dots
Client Advocacy and Benefits Counseling: 2 dots
Case Management: 1 dot
Acupuncture: 1 dot

Notes:

Oral Health
• Got the most votes because it is expensive
• UCSF is a recommended provider
• People with HIV should get 2-4 cleanings per year

Direct Emergency Financial Assistance
• Fills a gap
• Can be used for child care
• Can be used to support dental care at UCSF dental school

Food
• Salvation Army site works well
• Food Bank working well

Primary Medical Care
• Days/times not easily accessible to people working M-F
• Need PM and/or weekend hours

Transportation
• Very important to support access to appointments in SF

Mental Health Care
• Wants talk therapy through psychiatrist
• Can access at MAP, even if not a client

General
• Would like a list of resources in Marin that is easy to access
• Child care is important for access to health care when one has appointments
ATTACHMENT 2

Concerns/Recommendations for Strategic Planning/Consultant (Randy Allgaier)

CM Witt: 1) Our/my concern is that with all the expertise on Council we are concerned that we do not reflect all parts of our community nor identifying all needed services. We need skills and capabilities to verify or confirm the adequacy of our representation and process. As I see the proposal it uses us to make this confirmation.

2) A day of a Councilperson’s time is valuable and must have more purpose than identified.

CM Flores: Just needing more clarification on what will actually be addressed.

CM Malone: 1) Council doesn’t want the project as proposed. Don’t plan to defend it at December meeting.

2) If our goal is to create a strategic plan, we need to rethink the process and who will participate. Council members are not a good source of information for the planning process.

3) Our intent was to have a strategic plan for outreach not a plan for diversifying Council membership. Discussion has focused on our need to effectively reach out to underserved and unserved populations/communities and bring people with needs into care.

4) May want a process that brings provider (staff) into the discussion. (Consider collaborating with Maria Ramos-Chertok and her Cultural Competence work.)
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Categories in 07/8 priority order</th>
<th>06-07 CARE costcap reallocation</th>
<th>Amount Remaining</th>
<th>Amount Spent</th>
<th>Variance</th>
<th>Est $ amount over (-) or under (+)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Primary Medical Care</td>
<td>$125,000</td>
<td>$57,952</td>
<td>$67,048</td>
<td>-16.14%</td>
<td>-$20,173.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mental Health</td>
<td>$50,000</td>
<td>$36,256</td>
<td>$13,744</td>
<td>10.01%</td>
<td>$5,006.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Client Advocacy / Benefits</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Counseling</td>
<td>$87,500</td>
<td>56,842.00</td>
<td>$30,658</td>
<td>2.46%</td>
<td>$2,154.50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Case Management</td>
<td>$232,500</td>
<td>152,991.00</td>
<td>79,509</td>
<td>3.30%</td>
<td>$7,678.50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Home Health - Attendant and Professional Care</td>
<td>$72,241</td>
<td>42,879</td>
<td>$29,362</td>
<td>-3.14%</td>
<td>-$2,271.63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Substance Abuse Treatment</td>
<td>$60,000</td>
<td>$49,224</td>
<td>$10,776</td>
<td>19.54%</td>
<td>$11,724.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oral Health</td>
<td>$30,000</td>
<td>$26,129</td>
<td>$3,871</td>
<td>24.60%</td>
<td>$7,379.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Direct Emergency Financial</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assistance</td>
<td>$37,000</td>
<td>$27,409</td>
<td>$9,591</td>
<td>11.58%</td>
<td>$4,284.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Food</td>
<td>$63,300</td>
<td>$42,556</td>
<td>$20,744</td>
<td>4.73%</td>
<td>$2,993.50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Food Vouchers</td>
<td>$23,400</td>
<td>$23,400</td>
<td>$0</td>
<td>37.50%</td>
<td>$8,775.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Compl. Therapies - Acupuncture</td>
<td>$40,000</td>
<td>$29,113</td>
<td>$10,887</td>
<td>10.28%</td>
<td>$4,113.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transportation</td>
<td>$8,000</td>
<td>$2,877</td>
<td>$5,123</td>
<td>-26.54%</td>
<td>-$2,123.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Buddy / Companion / Volunteer</td>
<td>$50,000</td>
<td>$34,198</td>
<td>$15,802</td>
<td>5.90%</td>
<td>$2,948.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vitamins</td>
<td>$11,700</td>
<td>$5,874</td>
<td>$5,826</td>
<td>-12.29%</td>
<td>-$1,438.50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Outreach</td>
<td>$3,600</td>
<td>$3,600</td>
<td>$0</td>
<td>37.50%</td>
<td>$1,350.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Housing</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Legal Services</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Planning Council Support</td>
<td>$8,000</td>
<td>$5,834</td>
<td>$2,166</td>
<td>10.43%</td>
<td>$834.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Child Care</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quality Management (Consultant)</td>
<td>$12,000</td>
<td>$12,000</td>
<td>$0</td>
<td>37.50%</td>
<td>$4,500.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Infrastructure (cultural competency/outreach consultants)</td>
<td>$12,000</td>
<td>$12,000</td>
<td>$0</td>
<td>37.50%</td>
<td>$4,500.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Infrastructure (computers)</td>
<td>$10,000</td>
<td>$4,800</td>
<td>$5,200</td>
<td>-14.50%</td>
<td>-$1,450.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Infrastructure (client incentives satisfaction surveys)</td>
<td>$5,165</td>
<td>$5,165</td>
<td>$0</td>
<td>37.50%</td>
<td>$1,936.88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Infrastructure (County website)</td>
<td>$2,000</td>
<td>$2,000</td>
<td>$0</td>
<td>37.50%</td>
<td>$750.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Infrastructure (cultural competency translation, materials, agency websites)</td>
<td>$30,000</td>
<td>$30,000</td>
<td>$0</td>
<td>37.50%</td>
<td>$11,250.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Infrastructure (cultural competency staff time for training etc.)</td>
<td>$9,000</td>
<td>$7,689</td>
<td>$1,311</td>
<td>22.93%</td>
<td>$2,064.00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| Total | $982,406 | $670,788 | $311,618 | $84,240.38 | $27,456.13 |

$56,784.25 difference

In this table a positive variance means that the category has more money left than it should at the 3 month point. A negative variance means that the category has less money than it should at this point.

Example of formulas used:

```
variance = ((3/8) - (D5/B5))
Est $ amount = E5*B5
```
Voucher Funds Spent-Substance Abuse Treatment

Voucher Funds Spent-Oral Health

Voucher Funds Spent-Transportation

Voucher Funds Spent- Emerg/Pharm/Housing